



**Organisation Development
and Community
Management Trust
(ODCMT)**



Report

**SECOND NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE DIALOGUE ON THE LINKAGES BETWEEN
TRADE DEVELOPMENT AND POVERTY REDUCTION**

19th September 2006

Organised By Organisation Development and Community Management Trust (ODCM) and
Consumer Unity and Trust Society-Africa Resource Centre (CUTS-ARC)

**With Support from Department for International Development (DFID) UK and the
Ministry of Foreign Affairs Netherlands (MINBUZA)**

Table of Contents

	Page
Acknowledgements.....	3
List of Acronyms.....	4
Introduction and Background.....	5
Opening Session.....	7
1.1. Introductory Remarks by Mr. Wamundila Waliuya, Chairperson; ODCMT	7
1.2. Project background by Mr. Sajeev Nair Regional Advisor CUTS-ARC.....	7
Presentation of case studies.....	8
2.0.1 General overview on trade liberalization and its impacts: Zambia case studies.....	8
2.1. Trade liberalization and its impacts: on the agro-processing sector in Zambia	10
2.2. Response from discussants.....	11
2.3 Response from Participants.....	12
2.4 Trade liberalization and its impacts: on the Textile sector in Zambia	14
2.5. Response from discussants.....	18
2.5.2. Response from participants	18
2.6 Overall impact of trade liberalization on Zambian economy.....	20
Initiatives aimed at alleviating poverty in Zambia panel discussion	23
3.0 Poverty reduction and the fifth National Development Plan: panel discussion :	23
3.1. Global partnership for development, Millennium Development Goals	23
Closing Remarks.....	25
List of Annexure.....	26
Annex i Agenda.....	27
Annex ii Participants List.....	28
Annex iii Research Case Studies	31

Acknowledgements

This workshop is made possible with support from the Department for International Development (DFID) United Kingdom (UK) and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Netherlands (MINBUZA). This project is an initiative of Consumer Unity Trust Society for Centre for International Trade, Economics and Environment (CUTS-CITEE).

We would like to thank Mr. Kasote Singogo from the Economic Association of Zambia, Reverend Malawo Matyola; representing the Zambia Council for Social Development and Ms. Priscilla Mpundu, Executive Director of the Zambia Association for Research and Development (ZARD) for chairing respective sessions during the dialogue. We are grateful to Mr. Clement Chipokolo, Participatory Ecological Land Use Management (PELUM) Association Zambia, Mr. Tommy Mateo from the Civil Society for Poverty Reduction (CSPR), Mr. Sitali Muyatwa from the Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR) and Mr. Yusulf Dodia, representing the Private Sector Development Association (PSDA), for making specific comments to the case studies during the dialogue.

We thank CUTS-Africa Resource Centre (ARC) for their partnership and support in organizing the dialogue. Lastly but not least we thank all participants for their valued contributions during the process.

List of Acronyms

ACP	African Caribbean Pacific
AGOA	African Growth and Opportunities Act
ARC	Africa Resource Centre
CAP	Common Agriculture Policy
CET	Common External Tariffs
CITEE	Centre for International Trade, Economics and Environment
COMESA	Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa
CSTNZ	Civil Society Trade Network of Zambia
CUTS	Consumer Unity & Trust Society
DTIS	Diagnostic Trade Integrated Study
EBA	Everything But Arms
EC	European Community
EPZs	Establish Export Processing Zones
ESA	Eastern and Southern Africa
EPAs	Economic Partnership Agreements
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GDP	Gross Domestic Products
GMO	Genetically Modified Organisms
HACCP	Hazard Analysis Critical Control Points
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries Initiatives
LDC	Least Developed Countries
MCTI	Ministry of Commerce Trade and Industry
MFN	Most Favored Nations
MDG's	Millennium Development Goals
NGO	Non Governmental Organizations
ODCMT	Organisation development and Community Management Trust
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
RTA	Regional Trade Agreements
SADC	Southern Africa Development Community
SPS	Sanitary and Phyto-Sanitary
UNCTD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
VAT	Value Added Tax
WTO	World Trade Organisation
ZNFU	Zambia Nations Farmers Union
ZRA	Zambia Revenue Authority

Introduction and Background

The Linkages between Trade, Development and Poverty Reduction Project is being implemented in Zambia by the Consumer Unity Trust Society – Africa Resource Center and the Organisation Development and Community Management Trust (ODCMT). The project is an initiative of Consumer Unity Trust Society for Centre for International Trade, Economics and Environment (CUTS-CITEE) being implemented in Africa and Asia

The debate on linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction is not new. Trade policies potentially affect poverty through their effects on economic growth and income distribution, though it is also true that the effects of trade on income distribution have been more firmly established than its impact on growth. Given that poverty reduction is sensitive to income distribution, this is very significant.

Furthermore, a pro-poor growth policy has greater impact on reducing poverty, than growth per se. And, given the present trade and investment regime, an open and simple trade policy can foster some external discipline, reduce distortions on domestic markets, and narrow the scope for wrong or unbalanced policies in other areas.

Thus, there are various dimensions to the linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction. More so, both theoretical and political economic dimensions are changing as well as unfolding (i.e. the emergence of new ones) in this new trade and investment regime.

Some efforts are being made to look into the various dimensions of the issue, and making trade and investment liberalisation work for the poor. But, unfortunately, many such efforts do not attempt to look into the issue holistically, i.e. in both theoretical and political economic terms, supported by civil society's (Northern as well as Southern) understanding. Furthermore, issues relating to the effects of trade and investment liberalisation on the poor need to be looked into in a positive manner and an overarching purpose of all the activities is to find out the conditions necessary for mainstreaming international trade into national development (poverty reduction) strategy (keeping in mind issues relating to policy coherence).

Realising this vacuum and pursuant to its mandate of building consensus on issues affecting the livelihoods of the poor, CUTS-CITEE is undertaking this project on the Linkages between Trade, Development and Poverty (TDP) reduction over a period of four years.

The project envisages at manifesting the policy relevance of international trade on poverty reduction and thus, helps in articulating policy coherence (in particular between the international trading system and national development strategies). International trade has a major role to play to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDG's) and reduce absolute poverty by half by the year 2015.

International Trade is perceived as a means to reduce poverty but not an end in itself. Linkages between trade and economic growth, economic growth and poverty reduction are well established in literature. However, though there is theoretical literature explaining the linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction, not much empirical evidence is available to prove the robustness of this linkage. At the same time, in this era of globalization, the role of international trade in poverty reduction cannot be denied and more research and discussions are required to look into these issues objectively.

Activities under this project identify the role that international trade can and should play in reducing poverty in poor countries. Secondly, it will manifest the role of the civil society in creating an enabling policy environment (including advocating for “good governance” measures) so that maximum benefits are derived from increasing international trade in this era of globalization.

Objectives

The project will be implemented through the pursuance of the following inter-related objectives:

- To facilitate cross-fertilisation of experiences and lessons learnt on linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction in the developing countries to develop appropriate policy responses.
- To help strengthen the ability of developing countries through the provision of policy support and other know-how and do-how on trade and development issues, and to defend their viewpoints and negotiating and advocacy positions on issues of concern, prevailing and emerging in the international trading system and their relationship with development and poverty reduction.
- To facilitate synergy between governments and civil society organisations (between and among the Northern and Southern stakeholders) to learn from each other and strengthen their collective perspectives and positions in the emerging debate on the linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction.
- To advocate development-oriented trade policies, based on learning from research and other activities, by taking into account the interests and priorities (needs and aspirations) of the poor and marginalized sections of the society and look into the aspects of policy coherence.

It is therefore important to appreciate that the scope of the project seeking to investigate the links between trade, development and poverty is much broader than what is often understood.

OPENING SESSION

1.0. Chairperson's Remarks

The first session was chaired by Reverend Malawo Matyola, from the Zambia Council for Social Development (ZCSD). After welcoming participants he called upon Mr. Waliuya Wamundila, Chairperson for the Organisation Development and Community Management Trust (ODCMT) to give remarks and latter called upon the Regional Advisor for Consumer Unity and Trust Society-Africa Resource Centre (CUTS-ARC) who gave the background to the project.

1.1. Introductory Remarks by Mr. Wamundila Waliuya, Chairperson ODCMT

In his remarks Mr. Wamundila, thanked the Session Chairperson, and latter expressed gratitude to CUTS-ARC for the partnership under the project. He indicated that the project on the Linkages between Trade Development and Poverty Reduction (TDP) was very important to the efforts of reducing poverty by 2015; to this end ODCMT is glad to associate itself with these efforts.

He acknowledged the need for more dialogues on trade and poverty, as this is the only way to communicate concerns among and between stakeholders. Poverty is affecting millions of the citizens and the marginalised; and Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) should be recommended for having taken lead on campaigns aimed at reducing poverty, and urged Government to accommodate the views of CSOs. He later advised stakeholders to speak with the same language on issues of national development.

1.2. Project background by Mr. Sajeev Nair Regional Advisor CUTS-ARC

Mr Nair acknowledged the presence of the researchers Professor Seshamani, and Mr. Felix Simeo, and latter welcomed participants to the dialogue. He indicated that the basis for undertaking the two case studies on the agro-processing and textile sector, steamed from the first national dialogue which was held in August 2005, at which participants identified the two sectors on the basis that, after liberalisation the agro-processing sector has recorded a number of successes while the textile sector has recorded a negative performance.

He later highlighted that the project on the Linkages between Trade, Development & Poverty Project (TDP) is being implemented over a four year period, in fourteen countries of Africa Europe and Asia. The project has two major components; these being the research and advocacy components. In Zambia the research component is being undertaken by CUTS-ARC in collaboration with Professor Seshamani, lecturer at the University of Zambia (UNZA), while the advocacy component is being undertaken by ODCMT.

And thanked ODCMT for their proactive role in undertaking advocacy activities. Lastly he said that the project is an initiative of Consumer Unity & Trust Society for International Trade, Economics and Environment (CUTS-CITEE).

PRESENTATION OF CASE STUDIES

2.0 Introduction

The session was chaired by Mr. Kasote Singogo, who indicated that being part to the last dialogue he had keen interest to find out the outcomes of the studies. He later thanked CUTS and ODCMT for organizing the dialogue and later called upon Professor Seshamani, to make a presentation on the case studies.

2.0.1. General overview on trade liberalization and its impacts: Zambia case studies by: Professor Seshamani,

Professor Seshamani gave the introduction to the scenario of liberalization and its impact in Zambia based on the agro-processing and textile sectors.

‘Two frogs fell into a big pail of milk. They were unable to jump out of the pail. Both started paddling in order to remain afloat. But one of them despaired after some time, felt he could not continue and got drowned in the milk. The other frog thought that the only way to survive was to carry on paddling and so went on for a couple of hours. Suddenly, he felt something solid under his feet. It was a lump of freshly churned butter that had been produced as a result of his paddling. Not only did this frog survive, he also got some butter in the bargain’.

In the above story, substitute economic reform for the pail of milk, economic agents like firms for the frogs and economic benefits for the butter, and you have a story of the differential impacts of liberalization reforms. Some economic agents who are unable to make short to medium term adjustments to the policy reforms tend to go under, while others who are willing to use their ingenuity and effort to adjust to the changed circumstances eventually survive and reap the benefits of liberalization.

The story of the impact of trade reform in Zambia is no different. Trade liberalization has benefited some groups and left some other groups in a shambles. And of course, the differential impacts are more intricate than what is suggested by the fate of the frogs. While there are undoubtedly winners and losers, the winners and losers are not always distinct groups and at times the same groups could win in some ways and lose in some other ways, and the net result may not be readily obvious. Nevertheless from a more holistic perspective, one could say that some sectors in Zambia have benefited some more than others, while some other sectors have declined, as a result of trade liberalization.

Again it must be borne in mind that it is not easy to sift the impact of trade liberalization per se from that of the other liberalization and structural reform measures since they were all implemented almost simultaneously and one measure could have acted either as a catalyst or as an impediment to another. These other measures include privatization, strong fiscal disciplinary measures such as the introduction of the cash budget, public sector reform, liberalization in sectors such as agriculture, trade, finance and insurance with a view to boosting competition and private sector investment, and reforms such as the introduction of user charges in health and education.

The Zambia Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) 2002-2004 recognizes the following aims of trade policy and export promotion in particular: “Trade policy and export promotion are key to the expansion of the markets for domestically manufactured goods and ensuring international competitiveness in local production. The key issues here include the establishment of a fair domestic and foreign trade regime that facilitates trading to take place on a common set of agreed rules as opposed to discretion, and one that does not stifle domestic production and employment. The government will deal with matters of a symmetric access to markets, dumping, or export subsidies from major trading partners. In order to further encourage exports, bilateral, regional and multilateral trade regimes will be used to ensure that reciprocity is observed in leveling the playing field. Diversification of exports, especially manufactured goods, will be encouraged and modern commercial trading methods will be applied wherever feasible. The following measures were to be undertaken to boost export of manufactures during the PRSP implementation period:

- Train trade attaches and other staff involved in trade matters in market identification techniques and trade negotiation skills to ensure that Zambia extracts the optimum benefits from trade agreements and protocols.
- Identify export opportunities in markets that give Zambia preferential treatment for its exports such as the European Union under the Cotonou Agreement, and the United States of America (USA) market through the African Growth and Opportunity Act (AGOA). Export opportunities under Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (COMESA), Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), and similar regional bodies will also be pursued with added vigour.
- Establish Export Processing Zones (EPZs).
- Establish modern testing and calibration facilities at the Zambia Bureau of Standards (ZBS). The use of other private sector testing facilities that meet the required legal and technical standards will also be encouraged.
- Encourage establishment of private sector testing and calibration facilities.
- Create an enabling environment for quality assurance for goods meant for both domestic and export markets”.

The reason for reproducing the above extensive quote is to show that Zambia and its government are quite clear about the aims of trade reform and the specific measures that the country should implement to realize those aims. Why then has trade reform policies not produced a uniform positive impact on all sectors and groups in the country? The purpose of the case studies presented in this Report is to address such issues. Specifically, their objectives are:

1. To understand why some sectors have experienced improvements in outputs and exports, some more than others, while some other sectors have been subjected to very adverse impacts;
2. To establish the positive lessons that could be gleaned from the success stories of some sectors;
3. To establish the policy stances and practices that, if avoided, could have prevented or mitigated the negative impacts in some other sectors.

2.1. TRADE LIBERALIZATION AND ITS IMPACTS: ON THE AGRO-PROCESSING SECTOR IN ZAMBIA BY: PROFESSOR SESHAMANI,

2.1.1. Activities of the agro-processing sector

Agro-processing involves turning primary agricultural products into other commodities for the market. In Zambia the Agro-processing sector comprises industries whose core activities include:

- Snack food production.
- Fruit and vegetable drying.
- Oil (from groundnuts, sunflower and seed cotton) and Honey Processing.
- Cereal Milling (maize, wheat, Soya beans, etc).
- Peanut Butter production.
- Sugar processing.
- Mushroom processing.
- Dairy products.
- Beef production
- Fish farming and distribution.
- Tea, tobacco and coffee processing.
- Poultry farming.

The agro-processing sector has generally enjoyed a reasonably good market in Zambia with a notably indigenous production structure in the sense that the industries use a significantly high quantity of local raw materials. In addition to its contribution to national income, agro-processing has the potential to increase income and access to food for the poor who largely depend on agriculture for their livelihood, by establishing small-scale processing businesses that can be carried out at homes and do not require huge investment. Thus, through this transmission mechanism agro-processing can potentially reduce poverty in a sustainable manner.

2.1.2. Impact of trade liberalization on the agro-processing sector

It is generally observed that the agro-processing sector has recorded growth and expansion in the recent past years. This is particularly attributed to the deliberate efforts by government to support the agricultural sector, which is the key resource sector for the agro-processing industry. The agriculture sector has enjoyed a lot support from the government in its deliberate effort to diversify the economy from the mining sector to other sectors deemed to have business potential. In this sense, farmers have been given a lot of security. The sector has grown in terms of the number of players and thus productivity has risen. As a result of competition the agro-producers have been forced to increase the ranges of their products, which have been made possible through increased mechanisation of the processing plants. Thus, the sector has witnessed a facelift in terms of new technology that has led to significant reduction in the cost structures.

2.1.3. Impact on specific variables

Product range: There has been an increase in product range resulting from the companies' deliberate policy of diversification undertaken to counteract possible adverse impacts of trade liberalization.

Productivity: There has been an improvement in productivity on account of low costs incurred through a significant use of local raw materials.

Turnover: Turnover levels in general have been satisfactory since most firms have been able to withstand competition with their foreign counterparts.

Profit: In general, firms have been viable and profitable and not overly perturbed by competition.

Employment: There has been an expansion in employment owing to diversification that has necessitated increased labour.

Investment and capital formation: There has been substantial recapitalization but this has occurred more on account of change of ownership through privatization.

Human resource development: This has occurred to some extent only in the highly technical operations that require highly technical staff.

2.2. RESPONSE FROM DISCUSSANTS

2.2.1. Comments by: Mr. Clement Chipokolo: Participatory Ecological Land Use Management (PELUM) Association Zambia

Mr. Chipokolo, made the following observations on the agro-processing case study;

- For the agriculture sector, trade means markets and as such it would have made much relevant if the study took an interest to examine the linkages between markets and poverty reduction. He latter said that the agro-processing can reduce poverty in a sustainable manner once the problems of markets are addressed

- On the process used; he highlighted that market development bring in ripple effects and therefore the study should have considered the views of producers
- In comparison to neighboring countries, Zambia's agro-processing industry is still underdeveloped due to lack of access to modern technology, therefore the performance of the sector should have been done in comparison with regional countries
- He criticized the statement by the researcher that the sector is dominated by indigenous structures, as most of the organizations consulted during the research are foreign owned and in most cases raw materials and agro-products are imported
- The sector has not had a ripple effect on its growth as most activities are centralized in big cities such as Lusaka, and that the sector depends on seasonal products which are highly perishable and the study did not address these issues

Recommendations from the discussant

- He recommended that there should be put in place mechanisms to reduce the price margins between the farm price and the consumer price which until now is too wide
- And recommended that there should be a bias to building of infrastructure to support the sector
- Tax incentives should be provided to rural based agro investors
- Lastly he called upon for applied research which was more useful unlike academic research

2.2.2. Comments by: Mr. Muyatwa Sitali: Jesuit Centre for Theological Reflection (JCTR)

Mr. Muyatwa, made the following observations on the agro-processing case study;

- He indicated that despite the current imbalances, trade will remain good for growth and development
- He indicated that there is need for increased investments in health, education and transportation infrastructure
- The TDP case study on agro-processing gives an optimistic feature
- He indicated that the good performance of the sector was as a result of political will which should be extended to other sectors of the economy
- While the study indicates that most agro-processing industries use local raw materials these are used exploitatively. And while there is an increase in employment the challenge is to determine whether this is translated also in good wages for the sector
- There was need to consult indigenous firms because most of the consulted companies do not give a good indication of the real situation
- Lastly there is need for good investments in human capital, this will enhance productivity

2.3. Response from participants

The following comments were made by participants on the research findings;

- The world big powers have a focus of food security, with examples citing North America and China. In Zambia there have not been many efforts to enhance food security through processing. The country has fallen prey to making policies based on foreign advise
- The business environment is not very suitable to support and attract investment in food processing, therefore firms seeking investments in food processing should be supported by local financial facilities.

- The failure at the World Trade Organization (WTO) to reach an Agreement on Agriculture (AoA) indicates lack of commitments by Developed countries to enable Africa attain food security
- There is little effort to consult adequately before signing trade policies in Zambia. And the country risk signing the Economic Partnership Agreement (EPA) of classical models and not on practical lessons and experiences as it should be the case
- Zambia has a better food producing capacity, with abundant natural resources these should be utilized
- There was a concern as to whether the researcher identified primary products which have remained profitable, taking into consideration that poverty in rural areas has and continues to increase after liberalization
- There was a critic that we should avoid supporting the neo-liberal school of thought, where there should be winners and losers. And recommended that policy makers should focus on policies which brings about the win-win situation
- There was a call for clarification on which products have been diversified
- The Zambian economy has undergone transformation, and the winners losers scenario is an indication of economic transformation

2.3.1. Response from the presenter

- The research urged participants to understand that the objectives of the project of the project which are to learn the experiences of liberalization. And indicated that poverty cannot be reduced overnight it should be a gradual process
- He indicated that Zambia has not had growth for a number of years. And growth is a precondition for poverty reduction, therefore with the recorded growth the challenge is to ensure it is equitably distributed
- For industrial development to take off there should be infrastructure, to support the development. Therefore for Zambia to record balanced regional growth the cost of doing business in all regions should not vary greatly
- It's clear that firms use a significant amount of raw materials, as there are few instances where raw materials have been imported. Further a number of firms have gone into diversification in order to overcome challenges of seasonal raw materials
- At the moment there are winners and losers from liberalization which is not the ideal situation, as the research only portrays the existing situation. And tries to find out what makes winners win and losers lose, but does not support the win-lose situation
- The research does not portray an academic scenario but a practical situation based on research and interviews

2.4. TRADE LIBERALIZATION AND ITS IMPACTS: ON THE TEXTILE SECTOR IN ZAMBIA BY PROFESSOR SESHAMANI

2.4.1. Activities of textile sector

The textile sector is very critical to the Zambian economy not only in terms of its capacity to contribute to the country's export earning, but also in terms of employment creation that the government desires to achieve in order to reduce poverty. Historically the textile sector has had an outstanding record of export earnings in Zambia. For instance the textile sector was the largest exporting industry in 1996 among Non-Tradition Export (NTE) sectors, and has been second to Primary Agricultural Commodities in the ensuing years despite the declining trend after 1997. It has been among the top two NTE earners since 1994 following expanded investment especially in cotton spinning. (See Export Board of Zambia, 2000). Up until the onset of trade liberalization, Zambia had a well-established textile and clothing sector. But the sector which boasted of having

over 140 companies in the 1980s and empowering over 25,000 Zambians through provision of jobs saw mass closures of garment factories and scaling down of operations especially of the textile sub-sector with the resultant employment levels dropping to below 2,500 (Chikoti et al, 2002). The Zambian textile sector comprised of highly mechanized parastatal and private companies in all the spheres of textile operations that were captured by the study sample. These include cotton growing, spinning, weaving, knitting and garment manufacture.

The country previously had a very good market for the whole range of products that the sector produced. Today, the textile sector is faced with serious challenges, which have led to a decline in productivity forcing a number of industries to close down. This gloomy situation has largely been attributed to trade liberalization that removed restrictions both internally and externally and thus brought about competition, which many local industries seem to have not been ready for due to the inefficient manner in which they were run as they enjoyed protectionist policies from government.

The textile sector in Zambia, just like everywhere else requires a number of raw materials amongst which cotton is major. Cotton growing in Zambia has been very successful, especially in the recent past years.

Commercial cotton growing was previously dominated by LINTCO. After the privatization of LINTCO, many other commercial farmers switched their focus to other alternative crops like maize because cotton growing had become unviable.

Today cotton production is highly dominated by out-growers schemes, a principle that involves the mobilization of local farmers who are supplied with some basic inputs as one incentive to keep them in business.

Zambia produces a wide range of products, which include cotton lint, cotton yarn, poly/cotton yarn, acrylic yarn, cotton fabrics and cotton yarn fabrics.

2.4.1. Impact of trade liberalization on the textiles sector

In the wake of the general economic liberalization measures implemented since the early nineteen nineties, there has been a steady erosion of purchasing power of the population and as a result domestic demand for most local products significantly reduced in the last well over 10 years of trade liberalization. This problem has been compounded by dominance of the traditional foreign markets by countries with stronger economies. In the case of the textile sector this meant that people could not afford to buy new clothes, a situation that led to the influx of imported fabrics, which in turn impeded local industrial production. For instance, salaula (second hand clothes) and other Chinese fabrics have greatly undermined the Zambian textile sector. This situation has forced a number of industries that have survived closure to reduce their productivity and this has resulted in low capacity utilization of the existing textile infrastructure leading to a substantial number of jobs losses.

There was consensus of view among the respondents in this study that the Zambian textile sector previously produced a wider range of products than is the case today. Further, the textile industries that have survived the effects of trade liberalization are those in cotton processing on account of an increase in cotton production in Zambia.

Respondents also alluded to the view that local industries do not enjoy the maximum benefit of close proximity to the suppliers of most raw materials including cotton, which is actually locally grown and ginned. The issue of import parity pricing in the case of local raw cotton supply came

out prominently. It was observed that ever since the privatization of LINTCO, local raw cotton is quoted based on Liverpool price index causing local industries to bear the CIF costs, which includes the cotton price, shipping freight and insurance Cost. This unfair trade practice tends to push up the cost of production, which is in turn translated into high prices of the final products that are expected to compete with similar foreign products from countries whose price of local cotton is either controlled by government or ex-factory.

Lack of political will on the part of government to assist the sector was also a sore point with many respondents. They observed that unlike the South African textile industries for instance that enjoy lower production costs, economies of scale and greater capacity utilization, their Zambian counterpart firms do not enjoy these economic advantages since the Zambian government does not provide any form of subsidy or direct cash incentive payments for exporters including those that utilize local raw materials. While it is acknowledged that Zambia is a minor in as far as influencing international trade policies is concerned, there is need for it to put in place some safeguard measures to compensate for some unfair trade practices like import parity pricing. They further observed that such stimulant measures are practiced by a number of stronger economies like USA, China, and the EU to name a few, through the provision of subsidies.

2.4.2. Impact on specific variables

Product range: The sector has witnessed a decrease in product range caused by competition from foreign products and decline in people's purchasing power resulting from job losses.

Productivity: Apart from cotton growing, the sector has witnessed a significant decline in productivity owing to: (1) the dominance of the traditional markets and other foreign markets by the Asian tigers as a result of the removal of all quotas as per World Trade Organization (WTO) agreements in 2004; (2) inability to recapitalize; (3) high levels of indebtedness.

Turnover: Again, except for cotton growing, there has been a decline in turnover owing to reduced productivity and shrinkage of markets.

Profit: Most of the firms were just breaking even with their revenue structures prominently characterized by huge debts arising from domestic borrowing for restructuring, low productivity and shrunk markets.

Employment: There has been a major downsizing of the labor force as a result of decline in productivity. Only one firm in the sample experienced an increase in employment due to injection of capital by the shareholders and reorganization.

Investment and capital formation: All the firms surveyed have undergone substantial rehabilitations and mechanization necessitated by competition brought about by trade liberalization. Unfortunately the bulk of this investment is currently under-utilized because these firms have had to reduce production as a result of the shrinkage of the domestic markets.

Human resource development: The local education curriculum does not offer any textile training and as such all firms have had to either train staff on the job or send them abroad for training. However, the sector has benefited from the local education curriculum in as far as support professions are concerned.

2.4.3. Counting blessings: How one company overcame?

Within this sector that faced adverse challenges, we show what one company did to turn handicap to advantage.

“One of the major advantages of trade liberalisation is that it forced initiative on many business houses and individuals. Many companies realized the need to diversify. In our case we looked at cotton, whose supply was in few hands. Ginning of cotton was monopolized by private operators such as Lonrho, Clark cotton, today’s DUNAVANT and LINTCO that supplied us with most lint. But after privatization of LINTCO, these private operators monopolized the supply of cotton by forming what appeared to be a cartel that even regulated the prices. Unlike our company, the prime operation of these private operators was ginning of the cotton, which they sold both locally and abroad. Cotton lint was our main raw material on which the company spent two-thirds of its budget and thus we could not withstand the market conditions that prevailed as a result of the monopoly just alluded to.

The company therefore thought of setting up its own ginnery. We began by mobilizing local farmers and set up an out grower scheme. This idea won the support of one Indian firm. Our company sourced machinery from China and as a result a ginnery was set up in conjunction with this Indian firm. The objective of setting up this ginnery was to ensure consistent supply of lint cotton to our company and at a reasonable price. But this ginnery secretly began to supply cotton lint to other textile industries, and our company still did not get the benefits of close proximity to this ginnery. So we decided to set up a ginnery situated within our premises and this ginnery is still operational today.

To do this, we set up our own out-grower’s scheme by once again mobilizing local farmers whom we contract on some terms and we offer them some basic requirements on loan basis. This process is managed with the help of some extension officers who are trustees that ensure that all the cotton grown is supplied to our company.

Another advantage of trade liberalisation is that due to the shrinkage in our domestic market resulting from competition put up by *salaula* and other Chinese and Indian products, we were forced to start looking at other foreign markets such as Tanzania, Malawi, Mozambique and South Africa that we have managed to penetrate. In order to penetrate and sustain these markets, we had to improve the quality of our products by comparing them to imported products, which include *salaula*.

Maintenance of these foreign markets implies that the company has to move with time in all spheres of textile operations. This partly implies that the company has to keep upgrading its machinery and has indeed tried its best to do so.

As a result of trade liberalisation our company has also been forced to diversify. The company is now able to produce cooking oil from cotton seed, through a subsidiary firm. The objective of this move was to broaden the economic base of the company considering the fact that our business operation has peak and off-peak periods. We have also used garment manufacturing to mitigate our off peak period experiences of low returns due to low sales.”

2.5. RESPONSE FROM DISCUSSANTS

2.5.1. Comments by: Mr. Yusulf Dodia: Private Sector Development Association (PSDA)

Mr. Dodia, made the following observations on the case study for the textile sector;

- The second hand clothing commonly known as *Salaula* in Zambia has had a negative effect on the Zambian economy. The Zambian textile industry collapsed as a result of this, thousands of people lost jobs, and a number of textile growers were affected

- The coming in of the African Growth and Opportunities Act (AGOA) was expected to help change the fate of the textile industry through increased exports however, until now Zambia has failed to take advantage of the initiative
- The Textile industry was condemned by research findings; this was a short sight by government. The importance of the sector has been realized and government has made a policy direction towards revamping the sector as in the Commercial, Trade and Industrial Policy (CTI)
- The cost of borrowing is too high, there should be measures to reduce the cost of borrowing so that many people can be able to invest
- The traditional methods of selling commodities at international prices has had a negative effect to the performance of the sector
- There should be sincere partnership between private sector, civil society and donors
- Zambia should make use of Provisions under the WTO on Special and Safeguard Measures to protect its infant industries

2.5.2. Response from participants

The following observations were made by participants on the case study for the textile sector;

- Considering that the cost of borrowing is too high, financial lending institutions should take into account local business operation environment
- AGOA has not been very effective in mitigating the negative growth in the textile sector. The problem of quality is a Not Tariff Barrier to Trade (NTB) because Zambia used to produce quality fabric for the international market in Europe etc,
- There is nothing that has happened in the last 21 years to uplift the poor mans life, some important initiative like the Small Industry Development Board (SIDO), which were key to industrial development have faced operation difficulties
- In Zambia there is reluctance in pursuing and monitoring government policy, unlike Zimbabwe and India. The Zambia Investment Centre (ZIC) does not monitor investment performance and this has lead to a lot of closures of companies
- Research is key for development and currently there is lack of progress and consistent research to respond to policy challenges
- A question was posed as to whether Zambian companies especially respondents under the project's case studies were aware of the various initiatives to revive the sector, such as the Commercial Trade and Industrial Policy (CTI), Joint Integrated Technical Assistance Programme (JITAP) and the Private sector Development Association (PSDA)
- There is need to focus efforts at small scale producers such as tie and die if the sector has to be revived
- While it is important to have all these recommendation there was a major draw back because of government's absence at the dialogue
- Some participants wanted to know if there was space for private sector input into trade policy. And urged government to invest in research and development
- There was a concern as to whether the ago-processing sector would maintain its sustainability and current growth if Zambia had to part to the EPAs
- The labour environment is not competitive, to stimulate investment, this was cited to the fixing of the minimum wage by government
- Research should not be dictated, by donors. As this has proved to be costly for some sectors such as the textile

2.5.3. Response from the presenter

- Kafue Textile now African textiles were the main buyer of cotton in Zambia, until the acquired new technology on foreign advice, which could not use the local cotton. This lead to the company to import cotton in the long run it become expensive to operate and the company eventually collapsed. Because it become uncompetitive
- The strength of an economy depends on vital linkages between macro, economic and other economic instruments and policies. And the economy can not record growth based on good performance of trade policy only vice versa
- There was absence of interactions between government and Non Stake Actors (NSA) before signing trade agreements. This was cited to what transpired during WTO Hong Kong meeting
- There is a much difference in the diary industry between the farm price and consumer price. This has been exploitative to consumers and producers

2.6. OVERALL IMPACT OF TRADE LIBERALIZATION ON ZAMBIAN ECONOMY

2.6.1. Causal links between trade, development and poverty

There are wide but varying knowledge of the stakeholders regarding the link between trade, development and poverty reduction. And there is serious controversy regarding the impact of trade liberalization on economic development and its expected net effects on the living standards of the people. For instance, Tekere observes that, "Trade liberalization is one of the key elements of economic structural adjustments packages sold to developing countries by the Breton Woods Institutions, the WTO, bilateral and multilateral donors. It lies in the heart of the 'New Washington consensus' and has long been championed as a panacea to low economic growth being experienced in developing countries."

Achievements of South East Asia strongly support the view that export led growth policies serve as an engine for enhancing social welfare, human development, economic growth and development as well as serving as a mode for greater integration of these countries into the global economy. But contrary to such experiences, and particularly in Africa, there is conclusive evidence regarding the adverse role and impact of trade liberalization and globalization on human development, livelihoods, social welfare and economic development. Few African countries have benefited from trade liberalization (World Bank 1995, 1996) while in a number of cases liberalization was followed by misery, increased hardships, deterioration of human development, destruction of poor peoples' livelihoods, environment, high rates of inequality, marginalization of poor of countries and their communities.

Trade liberalization has had a direct casual link to poverty through the manner in which it has affected wages and employment, taxes and government spending and through the distribution of goods and services. The main channels through which trade shocks including trade liberalization have been transmitted into poverty impacts may well be appreciated by using Winter's (2000) analytical scheme, which provides a conceptual framework for interpreting the casual link between trade policy and poverty.

2.6.2. Distribution channels

Before any good reaches the consumer it passes through many stages on its way to or from the border. Each of these stages attracts a cost through transportation and tariffs that most often are transferred to the consumer and in turn reduces the proportionate impacts that are supposed to be felt by the consumers.

Wages and employment

In Zambia the effects of trade liberalization on the domestic enterprise immediately caught public attention. In this regard, the loss of jobs resulting from privatization, acting hand in glove with trade liberalization, was the most common reason.

Taxes and spending

Winter (ibid) observes that, "A major fear, although not universally justified by any means, is that trade liberalization reduces government revenue. If the compensatory increases in other taxes or decreases in expenditure impinged heavily on the poor, poverty could be exacerbated." Many people are of the view that a number of companies have either gone under or have relocated since the advent of trade liberalization and thus viewed this situation in terms of the potential revenue that would have accrued to government had these companies continued to operate.

2.6.3. Conclusions

While it is acknowledge that trade liberalisation as a good policy that has been adopted world wide, the manner in which its implementation in Zambia leaves much to be desired. Findings suggest that generally speaking most closures of our local industries appear to have been caused by opening up of the markets to international imports and also by the stiff domestic competition promoted by trade liberalisation. Consequently, redundancies emanating from liquidations and privatization of parastatal companies contributed to the deterioration in the living standards of the people.

As earlier alluded to trade liberalization aimed at creating a competitive and productive economy, which would be driven by private sector initiative with a view to enhance living standards for Zambians. Contrary of these expectations the stakeholders' general view is that since the advent of trade liberalisation the Zambian economy has been characterized by increased hardships among the poor, destruction of infrastructure and hence the environment. The number of firms have been closed is higher than that of the ones that have come on board. Thus, the rate of unemployment has increased resulting in the general decline in the purchasing power of the people. The income gap between the rich and the poor has widened resulting in increased inequality and marginalization of the poor. In summary, poverty has actually increased as opposed to the expected benefits of trade liberalisation.

However, notwithstanding the above shocks, since the advent of trade liberalisation the Zambian economy has witnessed the emergency of small scale entrepreneurs who are mostly middlemen and those engaged in re-processing and thus providing some form of employment and income to the poor.

2.6.4. Recommendations

Zambia should take extra caution when signing any international trade protocols because most of her industries are in their infant state and thus cannot absorb the shocks of having to compete with giant foreign counterparts including some of those in the region. This implies that Zambia does not seem to have the supply side capacity to exploit the opportunities that would be given under any international agreement. Foreign products have led to the closure of a number of local industries and thus Zambia has had a good lesson from which to prevent further adverse impacts.

Thus, Zambia must re-assess the gains from some of the trade agreements that have already been signed under COMESA and SADC. The benefits have so far not been overwhelming; hence the need to defer those agreements that have not yet come into effect such as the SADC trade protocols due to come into effect in 2008. For instance, we should realize the danger of 100% removal of duty on wheat, under the SADC trade protocol. Once this agreement is effected Zambia's traditional market will be dominated by foreign industries from giant economies like South Africa. These international trade protocols have introduced unfair trade practices that have in turn killed local production, hence the need for a more strategic approach.

The business community in Zambia has also taken too long to adjust to the liberalized environment. This slow process of adjustment is largely attributable to government failure to provide the necessary direction like has been the case with a few sectors, which include among others the agricultural, the transport and the financial sectors. The financial sector for instance, had over the years remained widely underdeveloped, but has in the recent years improved and is able to harness local savings to support investment although the cost of borrowing is still high.

It was should be realized that trade liberalisation is just one necessary condition for economic growth and not a sufficient condition to reduce poverty, especially given the asymmetrical relationship between economic growth and poverty reduction. Generally the objective function of

most businesses is to maximize profits and thus in order for trade liberalisation to benefit the poor there has to be coherence between trade policies and national development policies.

INITIATIVES AIMED AT ALLEVIATING POVERTY IN ZAMBIA PANEL DISCUSSION

3.0 POVERTY REDUCTION AND THE FIFTH NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN: PANELIST: Mr. TOMMY MATEO, CSPR

Mr. Mateo gave a brief background of the Civil Society for Poverty Reduction (CSPR), indicating that it is a network of over 2000 organization countrywide. The network come into being in 2002 to try and advocate issues pertaining to the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP). The network was involved in the designing, formulation and implementation of the PRSP. The organization has strength in research, advocacy and lobby activities. The network provides capacity building and policy dialogue on issues on direct budget support, and other key national policy developments such as the National Development Plan (NDP).

The networks works through thematic groups which composed of government and civil society representatives commonly referred to as Sector Advisory Groups (SAGs), the Provincial Development Committees (PDC) and the District Development Committee (DDC). These groups have provided key input into the formulation of the fifth National Development Plan (FNDP). Through his process CSPR has managed to come up a civil society perspective of the Fifth National Development Plan (FNDP) with a However, there was a major draw back to the official government process of formulating the FNDP, because only 6 representatives from civil society were given space.

3.1. GLOBAL PARTNERSHIP FOR DEVELOPMENT, MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS: PANELIST: Mr. HENRY MALUMO

He started with a citation of the 2005, Speech by the United Nations (UN) Secretary General Kofi Anna, in which he highlighted that poverty devastates families and over 800 milion people worldwide are hungry, with over 30 million children dying everyday. And only 75,000 people revive Anti Ritro Viral treatment (ARVs).

In summary the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) aims to achieve the following; reducing extreme poverty by half in 2015, ensure that by 2015 children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a course of primary schooling, eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and to all levels of education no later than 2015, reduce child mortality by tow-thirds, between 1990 and 2015, reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio, to halt HIV/AIDS_by 2015, and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS, to eradicate Malaria and other diseases by 2015, and began reversing the spread of malaria and other diseases, integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources, reduce by half the proportion without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation and provide a global partnership for development.

He indicated that aligning the MDGs to National Development Plan (NDP) was key to national development. However, there is need for continuous assessment and proper road map to ensure we attain objectives set out under the MDGs. Debt and aids are not realistic but the MDGs and trade justice is a realistic means of lifting over 500,000 million out of poverty.

There a number of challenges to the attainment of the MDGs worldwide, these include a political approach, and lack of proper world wide road map. Zambia may not achieve the MDGs because

of the current existing political situation and lack of proper focus on efforts in the health sector and inappropriate priority setting. However, there are good indicators from the last meeting of group of eight nations commonly referred to as the G8, in St Petersburg in Russia, where they promised efforts aimed at addressing the debt situation in poor countries and trade imbalances

3.1.1. Comments from the Chairpersons

The chairperson for the session made the following interventions;

- There should be room for wide and adequate consultation on any important policy before it is finalized
- Civil society should be more proactive and not allow government to suppress them, this was in reference to the exclusion behavior where only six civil society organizations were allowed to participate in the FNDP making process
- There should be more participation by private sector in civil society consultations
- There should be good priority setting and monitoring by government on various policy which affect human life
- The removal of user fees on Education will not help in achieving the MDG on providing primary education. Because schools have introduced other fees which are more than user fees

3.1.2. Response from participants

The following comments were made by participants based on presentations;

- There was a concern on legitimacy, as there should be clarity on legitimacy, because some conflicts arising between Civil Society and Government are a result of lack of clarity on legitimacy
- Civil society were consulted before private sector therefore civil society should be considerate to private sector in its activities
- On aid most countries which received aid have become poorer therefore aid is not a precondition for poverty reduction
- The failure at the WTO to end the agriculture subsidies is a big challenge to Africa and Zambia in particular. As developed countries spend six times more on subsidies to their farmers than what it gives in aid to poor countries
- The 2005 MDGs report is giving positive indications, there is need for an on going debate and dialogue to give reactions to the reports
- There is an inconsistency of figure in the FNDP and medium Term Expenditures Framework (MTEF)., this is not good to analyzing policies
- There was a concern as to whether Civil society had endorsed the FNDP its current form and if not CSOs should come up with a response
- There was a critic as to why efforts under the MDG project are not concentrating on what is priority to the country

3.1.3. Response from Panelists

The panelists gave the following reactions;

- During the meeting of the MDGs in Zambia 80 percent of participants were government, this was not balanced a balanced approach
- The process was rushed because the government objective was to go and make a presentation in New York. On the basis that consultations would resume once the team returns from New York
- A lot of targets were missed in the FNDP, and foreign governments have contributed to failures of policies in Zambia

- There was a reaction from one participants indicating that there is a national committee on Aid for Trade and a lot of work has been done the final report is expected soon
- Government is key in any process as it forms the process while CSO take the lead in advocacy
- So many workshops have been held under the MGDs hence there was need to restructure the strategies
- CSPR indicated that the only efforts done was to make specific inputs into the process and not endorse the FNDP
- The minister of Finance has more authority in determining allocation of resource to various sectors in the economy, hence it was good to engage the Ministry of Finance and National Planning (MoFNP) in such meetings

Closing Remarks by Session Chairperson, Ms. Priscilar Mpundu

The session chairperson indicated that there was a good indication currently for sharing of information on key policy issues on EPAs, WTO, etc. and debates and dialogues are necessary for policy formulation. However, there is a great challenge of making common man understand the current policy debates.

On behalf of the organizers Ms. Mpundu, thanked, panelist and participants for their valued contributions to the process.

List of Annexure

1. Annex I Agenda
2. Annex II Participants List
3. Annex III Trade liberalization and its impacts: Zambia case studies

Annex I

Agenda

National Consultative Dialogue on the Linkages between Trade Development and Poverty Reduction

19th September 2006 – Crest Golf View Hotel Lusaka,

08:30 -10:00 Hrs Opening Session

Chairperson Session – Rev. Matyola

- 08:30 -09:00: Registration
- 09:00- 09:15 Hrs Introductory Remarks –ODCMT Board Chairperson
- 09:15 -09:30 Hrs Project Background (CUTS-ARC)

10:00-10:15 Hrs Tea Break

10:15 -13:00 Hrs Agri-processing and Textile Sectors
--

Chairperson Session- Kasote Singogo

- 10:15-10:45 Hrs Presentation of case study on Agro-Processing (Professor V. Seshamani / Felix Simeo)
- 10:45-11:00 Hrs Comments and viewpoints (PELUM, JCTR, EAZ)
- 11:00 – 11:30 Hrs Floor Discussions
- 11:30 -12:00 Hrs Presentation of case study on Textile
- Sector (Professor V. Seshamani/ Felix Simeo)
- 12:00 – 12:15 Hrs Comments and viewpoints (Yusulf Dodia PSDA)
- 12:15:-13:00 Hrs Floor Discussions

13:00- 14:00 Hrs- Lunch Break

14:00 -15:30 Hrs other issues on initiatives aimed at alleviating Poverty

Chairperson Session- Pricilla Mpundu

Panellists

- 14:00-14:20 Hrs – Poverty Reduction and FNDP- Tommy Mateo - C SPR
- 14:20-14:40 Hrs – Global Partnership for Development -MDG 8– Henry Malumo
- 14: 40-15:15 Hrs – Floor Discussions
- 15:15 – 15:30 Hrs- Vote of thanks- project partners

15: 30 Hrs- Tea Break and End of programme

Annex ii

List of participants

National Consultative Dialogue on the Linkages between Trade Development and Poverty Reduction 19th September 2006

	Name	Organization and Contact Details
1	Tommy Mateo	Civil Society for Poverty Reduction (CSPR) Nashila Road Kalundu Lusaka, tell: 29 0154 cell: 099526046 Email tmateo75@yahoo.co.uk
2	Kasote Singogo	CSPR/ZARD Cell: 095752721 email: kasote.singogo@yahoo.co.uk
3	Grace B. Manyonga	Hivos, Rhodes Park Nkachibaya Road Plot 7 tell: 251702 email: grace.manyonga@hivos.org.zm
4	Joshua Jere	Zambia National Broadcasting Corporation (ZNBC) Alicjk Nkata Road cell: 097 750531 tell: 251983 email: joshuajere2003@yahoo.com
5	Felix Simeo	University of Zambia (UNZA), Economic department box 32379 cell: 097361430
6	Clement Chipokolo	PELUM tell: 295392, email: clementc@coppernet.zm
7	Chulu Kabanda	POST newspaper36 Bwinjinfumu Road tell: 231092 cell: 097 966290 email: chulukabunda@yahoo.com
8	James Ngoma	Muvi Pose, WEPA complex off Losangles Road Lusaka Cell: 097800139 email: chamannyazi@hotmail.com
9	Tadeo Taruvinga	Cross Boarder Trades Association Common Market for East and Southern Africa (COMESA) Centre cell: 095758277, 096459957 email: cbta@microlink.zm
10	George Mwila Chimembe	Initiative for Sustainable Rural Livelihood 8 th Floor Indeco House cell: 097358359, 097134972 email: isrl_zambia@yahoo.com chimembegeorge@yahoo.co.uk

- 11 Priscilla. S. Mpundu Zambia Association for Research and Development (ZARD) 1517 manchinchi road northmead cell: 095430655, tell: 224536 email: zard@microlink.zm
- 12 Angela Mwape Mulenga Civil Society Trade Network of Zambia (CSTNZ) BB 88 Bishop Road Kabulonga cell: 097762384 estnz@coppernet.zm anglmwape@yahoo.com
- 13 Reverend Malawo Matyola Zambia Council for Social Development (ZCSD) Box 51055 Lusaka tell: 236219 email: zcsdsecretariat@yahoo.com
- 14 Tebuho Yabai Pact Zambia Box 50738 Lusaka cel; 097566666, 095402889 tel:255058-9 email: tebhoy@pactzambia.org
- 15 Lars Jensen CUTS-ARC tell: 224892 email: cutsarc@zamnet.zm
- 16 Vladimir Chilinya CUTS-ARC tell: 224892 email: cutsarc@zamnet.zm
- 17 Sajeev Nair CUTS-ARC tell: 224892 email: cutsarc@zamnet.zm
- 18 V. Seshamani UNZA 53/45, GE Road Lusaka tell: 227193, fax 290475 email: sesh@zamnet.zm lalsesh@yahoo.com
- 19 Yusulf Dodia Action Computers Mulungushi Conference centre tell: 291018, 291024, 293914 fax: 291039 email: yusufd@action.com.zm psda@coppernet.zm
- 20 Annel Sakala Monitor Newspaper Church House Cairo Road cell: 097538307 email: annelsakala@yahoo.co.uk
- 21 Chris Aka Kabwe Road 10 Miles cell: 097662300 email: chrisakala2002@yahoo.com

- 22 Muyatwa Richard JCTR Plot 5880 Great East Road Lusaka tell:
Sitali 290410 cell: 097414259 email:
musitati@yahoo.com debtjctr@jesuits.org.zm
- 23 Harry Ngoma Agriculture Support Programe (ASIP) plot 8857
 Alick Nhkata Road tell: 250250 fax: 253532
 email: hngoma@asp.org.zm
- 24 Mutale Wakunuma One World Action Plot 6499 P.O Box 37011
 tell: 292740 fax: 294188 Email:
 mutale.muyanda@oneworld.net
 mutalemw@yahoo.com
- 25 Eugene Phiri Hot F.M Radio 8th Floor provident House Cairo
 Road Lusaka Cell: 097349110 tell: 234329
 email: eugunepk@yahoo.co.uk
- 26 Dev Babbar ZAM tell: 222912 email: babbar@zanet.zm
- 28 Bridget Yembe ODCMT tell: 231322 email:
 odcmt@microlink.zm
- 29 Irene Banda ODCMT tell: 231322 email:
 odcmt@microlink.zm
- 30 Zindikilani Daka ODCMT tell: 231322 email:
 odcmt@microlink.zm
- 31 Mary Banda ODCMT tell: 231322 email:
 odcmt@microlink.zm
- 35 Joshua Jere Zambia National Broadcasting Corporation

Annex iii

Trade liberalization and its impacts: Zambia case studies¹

Part 1: Introduction and methodology

Introduction

Two frogs fell into a big pail of milk. They were unable to jump out of the pail. Both started paddling in order to remain afloat. But one of them despaired after some time, felt he could not continue and got drowned in the milk. The other frog thought that the only way to survive was to carry on paddling and so went on for a couple of hours. Suddenly, he felt something solid under his feet. It was a lump of freshly churned butter that had been produced as a result of his paddling. Not only did this frog survive, he also got some butter in the bargain.

In the above story, substitute economic reform for the pail of milk, economic agents like firms for the frogs and economic benefits for the butter, and you have a story of the differential impacts of liberalization reforms. Some economic agents who are unable to make short to medium term adjustments to the policy reforms tend to go under, while others who are willing to use their ingenuity and effort to adjust to the changed circumstances eventually survive and reap the benefits of liberalization.

The story of the impact of trade reform in Zambia is no different. Trade liberalization has benefited some groups and left some other groups in a shambles. And of course, the differential impacts are more intricate than what is suggested by the fate of the frogs. As has been suggested in the earlier Overview paper on the linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction in Zambia, while there are undoubtedly winners and losers, the winners and losers are not always distinct groups and at times the same groups could win in some ways and lose in some other ways, and the net result may not be readily obvious. Nevertheless from a more holistic perspective, one could say that some sectors in Zambia have benefited some more than others, while some other sectors have declined, as a result of trade liberalization.

Again, as has been stated in the Overview paper, it must be borne in mind that it is not easy to sift the impact of trade liberalization per se from that of the other liberalization and structural reform measures since they were all implemented almost simultaneously and one measure could have acted either as a catalyst or as an impediment to another. These other measures include privatization, strong fiscal disciplinary measures such as the introduction of the cash budget, public sector reform, liberalization in sectors such as agriculture, trade, finance and insurance with a view to boosting competition and private sector investment, and reforms such as the introduction of user charges in health and education.

The Zambia Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2002-2004 recognizes the following aims of trade policy and export promotion in particular:

“Trade policy and export promotion are key to the expansion of the markets for domestically manufactured goods and ensuring international competitiveness in local production. The key issues here include the establishment of a fair domestic and foreign trade regime that facilitates

¹ This report has been prepared by Professor Venkatesh Seshamani of the Department of Economics, University of Zambia. He was assisted by his colleague Mr. Felix Simeo who was responsible for undertaking the fieldwork for the study and compiling the data.

trading to take place on a common set of agreed rules as opposed to discretion, and one that does not stifle domestic production and employment. The government will deal with matters of a symmetric access to markets, dumping, or export subsidies from major trading partners. In order to further encourage exports, bilateral, regional and multilateral trade regimes will be used to ensure that reciprocity is observed in leveling the playing field. Diversification of exports, especially manufactured tradeables, will be encouraged and modern commercial trading methods will be applied wherever feasible. The following measures will be taken to boost of export of manufactures during the PRSP implementation period:

- Train trade attaches and other staff involved in trade matters in market identification techniques and trade negotiation skills to ensure that Zambia extracts the optimum benefits from trade agreements and protocols.
- Identify export opportunities in markets that give Zambia preferential treatment for its exports such as the European Union under the Cotonou Agreement, and the USA market through the African Growth and Opportunity Act (AGOA). Export opportunities under COMESA, SADC, and similar regional bodies will also be pursued with added vigour.
- Establish Export Processing Zones (EPZs).
- Establish modern testing and calibration facilities at the Zambia Bureau of Standards. The use of other private sector testing facilities that meet the required legal and technical standards will also be encouraged.
- Encourage establishment of private sector testing and calibration facilities.
- Create an enabling environment for quality assurance for goods meant for both domestic and export markets”.

The reason for reproducing the above extensive quote is to show that Zambia and its government are quite clear about the aims of trade reform and the specific measures that the country should implement to realize those aims. Why then has trade reform policies not produced a uniform positive impact on all sectors and groups in the country? The purpose of the case studies presented in this Report is to address such issues. Specifically, their objectives are:

1. To understand why some sectors have experienced improvements in outputs and exports, some more than others, while some other sectors have been subjected to very adverse impacts;
2. To establish the positive lessons that could be gleaned from the success stories of some sectors;
3. To establish the policy stances and practices that, if avoided, could have prevented or mitigated the negative impacts in some other sectors.

Methodology

A sample survey, circumscribed by constraints of time and budget, was undertaken during the period November to December 2005. Two sectors were chosen for a detailed investigation. On the basis of available evidence, the sectors proposed were: the agro-processing sector as an instance of the positive impact of trade liberalization and the textile sector as an instance of the negative impact.²

² We would like to reiterate that this is only to be understood in a typical sense. It does not imply that there were no individual success stories in the textile sector or individual failures in agro processing.

From each of these sectors, a limited number of firms was carefully selected from Lusaka and the Copper-belt that would be broadly representative of the sectors, and the selected sectors were then studied at length. Details of the chosen sample are provided in the Appendix.

The emphasis of the study was primarily qualitative, although quantitative data deemed useful and pertinent, was elicited for the purpose of complementing qualitative information.

Information was gathered through one-on-one interviews with the Chief executive officers (CEOs) of the selected companies as well as with key personnel in industry and government. The list of those interviewed is again provided in the Appendix. The interviews were based on a list of critical questions that were posed to the interviewees. The interviews, however, were flexibly structured and conducted in the form of a bilateral dialog between the interviewer and the respondent. In this respect, the Delphi method of back-and-forth questioning and cross-questioning was employed in order to arrive at consistent insights and inferences.

This report attempts to describe the experiences of the two selected sectors as a whole and of the chosen firms. An analysis of these experiences is then made in order to derive lessons regarding the linkage between trade liberalization, growth and poverty reduction. For purpose of maintaining confidentiality, we shall not make significant allusions to information gathered from specific companies or from interviews with specific key personnel. Only statements on broad views and general inferences emerging from collective information will be made.

Part 2: The agro-processing sector

Activities of the agro-processing sector

Agro-processing involves turning primary agricultural products into other commodities for the market. In Zambia the Agro-processing sector comprises industries whose core activities include:

- Snack food production.
- Fruit and vegetable drying.
- Oil (from groundnuts, sunflower and seed cotton) and Honey Processing.
- Cereal Milling (maize, wheat, Soya beans, etc).
- Peanut Butter production.
- Sugar processing.
- Mushroom processing.
- Dairy products.
- Beef production
- Fish farming and distribution.
- Tea, tobacco and coffee processing.
- Poultry farming.

The agro-processing sector has generally enjoyed a reasonably good market in Zambia with a notably indigenous production structure in the sense that the industries use a significantly high quantity of local raw materials. In addition to its contribution to national income, agro-processing has the potential to increase income and access to food for the poor who largely depend on agriculture for their livelihood, by establishing small-scale processing businesses that can be carried out at homes and do not require huge investment. Thus, through this transmission mechanism agro-processing can potentially reduce poverty in a sustainable manner.

Impact of trade liberalization on the agro-processing sector

The respondents observed that the agro-processing sector has recorded growth and expansion in the recent past years. This is particularly attributed to the deliberate efforts by government to support the agricultural sector, which is the key resource sector for the agro-processing industry. The agriculture sector has enjoyed a lot support from the government in its deliberate effort to diversify the economy from the mining sector to other sectors deemed to have business potential. In this sense, farmers have been given a lot of security. The sector has grown in terms of the number of players and thus productivity has risen. As a result of competition the agro-producers have been forced to increase the ranges of their products, which have been made possible through increased mechanisation of the processing plants. Thus, the sector has witnessed a facelift in terms of new technology that has led to significant reduction in the cost structures.

Impact on specific variables

Product range: There has been an increase in product range resulting from the companies' deliberate policy of diversification undertaken to counteract possible adverse impacts of trade liberalization.

Productivity: There has been an improvement in productivity on account of low costs incurred through a significant use of local raw materials.

Turnover: Turnover levels in general have been satisfactory since most firms have been able to withstand competition with their foreign counterparts.

Profit: In general, firms have been viable and profitable and not overly perturbed by competition.

Employment: There has been an expansion in employment owing to diversification that has necessitated increased labour.

Investment and capital formation: There has been substantial recapitalization but this has occurred more on account of change of ownership through privatization.

Human resource development: This has occurred to some extent only in the highly technical operations that require highly technical staff.

Part 3: Textile sector

Activities of textile sector

The textile sector is very critical to the Zambian economy not only in terms of its capacity to contribute to the country's export earning, but also in terms of employment creation that the government desires to achieve in order to reduce poverty. Historically the textile sector has had an outstanding record of export earnings in Zambia. For instance the textile sector was the largest exporting industry in 1996 among Non-Tradition Export (NTE) sectors, and has been second to Primary Agricultural Commodities in the ensuing years despite the declining trend after 1997. It has been among the top two NTE earners since 1994 following expanded investment especially in cotton spinning. (see Export Board of Zambia, 2000).

Up until the onset of trade liberalization, Zambia had a well-established textile and clothing sector. But the sector which boasted of having over 140 companies in the 1980s and empowering over 25,000 Zambians through provision of jobs saw mass closures of garment factories and scaling down of operations especially of the textile sub-sector with the resultant employment levels dropping to below 2,500 (Chikoti et al, 2002). The Zambian textile sector comprised of highly mechanized parastatal and private companies in all the spheres of textile operations that were captured by the study sample. These include cotton growing, spinning, weaving, knitting and garment manufacture.

The country previously had a very good market for the whole range of products that the sector produced. Today, the textile sector is faced with serious challenges, which have led to a decline in productivity forcing a number of industries to close down. This gloomy situation has largely been attributed to trade liberalization that removed restrictions both internally and externally and thus brought about competition, which many local industries seem to have not been ready for due to the inefficient manner in which they were run as they enjoyed protectionist policies from government.

The textile sector in Zambia, just like everywhere else requires a number of raw materials amongst which cotton is major. Cotton growing in Zambia has been very successful, especially in the recent past years.

Commercial cotton growing was previously dominated by LINTCO. After the privatization of LINTCO, many other commercial farmers switched their focus to other alternative crops like maize because cotton growing had become unviable.

Today cotton production is highly dominated by out-growers schemes, a principle that involves the mobilization of local farmers who are supplied with some basic inputs as one incentive to keep them in business.

Zambia produces a wide range of products, which include cotton lint, cotton yarn, poly/cotton yarn, acrylic yarn, cotton fabrics and cotton yarn fabrics.

Impact of trade liberalization on the textiles sector

In the wake of the general economic liberalization measures implemented since the early nineteen nineties, there has been a steady erosion of purchasing power of the population³ and as a result domestic demand for most local products significantly reduced in the last well over 10 years of trade liberalization. This problem has been compounded by dominance of the traditional foreign markets by countries with stronger economies. In the case of the textile sector this meant that

³ Average annual growth rate of the economic was close to nil and there was an increase in the incidence of poverty.

people could not afford to buy new clothes, a situation that led to the influx of imported fabrics, which in turn impeded local industrial production. For instance, *salaula* and other Chinese fabrics have greatly undermined the Zambian textile sector.⁴ This situation has forced a number of industries that have survived closure to reduce their productivity and this has resulted in low capacity utilization of the existing textile infrastructure leading to a substantial number of jobs losses.

There was consensus of view among the respondents in this study that the Zambian textile sector previously produced a wider range of products than is the case today. Further, the textile industries that have survived the effects of trade liberalization are those in cotton processing on account of an increase in cotton production in Zambia.

Respondents also alluded to the view that local industries do not enjoy the maximum benefit of close proximity to the suppliers of most raw materials including cotton, which is actually locally grown and ginned. The issue of import parity pricing in the case of local raw cotton supply came out prominently. It was observed that ever since the privatization of LINTCO, local raw cotton is quoted based on Liverpool price index causing local industries to bear the CIF costs, which includes the cotton price, shipping freight and insurance Cost. This unfair trade practice tends to push up the cost of production, which is in turn translated into high prices of the final products that are expected to compete with similar foreign products from countries whose price of local cotton is either controlled by government or ex-factory.

Lack of political will on the part of government to assist the sector was also a sore point with many respondents. They observed that unlike the South African textile industries for instance that enjoy lower production costs, economies of scale and greater capacity utilization, their Zambian counterpart firms do not enjoy these economic advantages since the Zambian government does not provide any form of subsidy or direct cash incentive payments for exporters including those that utilize local raw materials. While it is acknowledged that Zambia is a minor in as far as influencing international trade policies is concerned, there is need for it to put in place some safeguard measures to compensate for some unfair trade practices like import parity pricing. They further observed that such stimulant measures are practiced by a number of stronger economies like USA, China, and the EU to name a few, through the provision of subsidies.

Impact on specific variables

Product range: The sector has witnessed a decrease in product range caused by competition from foreign products and decline in people's purchasing power resulting from job losses.

Productivity: Apart from cotton growing, the sector has witnessed a significant decline in productivity owing to: (1) the dominance of the traditional markets and other foreign markets by the Asian tigers as a result of the removal of all quotas as per World Trade Organization (WTO) agreements in 2004; (2) inability to recapitalize; (3) high levels of indebtedness.

Turnover: Again, except for cotton growing, there has been a decline in turnover owing to reduced productivity and shrinkage of markets.

⁴ Prior to trade liberalization also there was an inflow of used clothing brought in by religious and charitable organizations for distribution on a non-profit basis to the poor. Subsequently, some private businesses too imported a whole range of used garments that could be bought by everyone. However, owing to restrictions imposed by import licensing and foreign exchange controls, the quantities of such imports were still small and did not pose any threat to the products sold by domestic textile firms.

Profit: Most of the firms were just breaking even with their revenue structures prominently characterized by huge debts arising from domestic borrowing for restructuring, low productivity and shrunk markets.

Employment: There has been a major downsizing of the labor force as a result of decline in productivity. Only one firm in the sample experienced an increase in employment due to injection of capital by the shareholders and reorganization.

Investment and capital formation: All the firms surveyed have undergone substantial rehabilitations and mechanization necessitated by competition brought about by trade liberalization. Unfortunately the bulk of this investment is currently under-utilized because these firms have had to reduce production as a result of the shrinkage of the domestic markets.

- *Human resource development:* The local education curriculum does not offer any textile training and as such all firms have had to either train staff on the job or send them abroad for training. However, the sector has benefited from the local education curriculum in as far as support professions are concerned.

Counting blessings: How one company overcame

Within this sector that faced adverse challenges, we show what one company did to turn handicap to advantage.

“One of the major advantages of trade liberalisation is that it forced initiative on many business houses and individuals. Many companies realized the need to diversify. In our case we looked at cotton, whose supply was in few hands. Ginning of cotton was monopolized by private operators such as Lonrho, Clark cotton, today’s DUNAVANT and LINTCO that supplied us with most lint. But after privatization of LINTCO, these private operators monopolized the supply of cotton by forming what appeared to be a cartel that even regulated the prices. Unlike our company, the prime operation of these private operators was ginning of the cotton, which they sold both locally and abroad. Cotton lint was our main raw material on which the company spent two-thirds of its budget and thus we could not withstand the market conditions that prevailed as a result of the monopoly just alluded to.

The company therefore thought of setting up its own ginnery. We began by mobilizing local farmers and set up an out grower scheme. This idea won the support of one Indian firm. Our company sourced machinery from China and as a result a ginnery was set up in conjunction with this Indian firm. The objective of setting up this ginnery was to ensure consistent supply of lint cotton to our company and at a reasonable price. But this ginnery secretly began to supply cotton lint to other textile industries, and our company still did not get the benefits of close proximity to this ginnery. So we decided to set up a ginnery situated within our premises and this ginnery is still operational today.

To do this, we set up our own out-grower’s scheme by once again mobilizing local farmers whom we contract on some terms and we offer them some basic requirements on loan basis. This process is managed with the help of some extension officers who are trustees that ensure that all the cotton grown is supplied to our company.

Another advantage of trade liberalisation is that due to the shrinkage in our domestic market resulting from competition put up by *salaula* and other Chinese and Indian products, we were

forced to start looking at other foreign markets such as Tanzania, Malawi, Mozambique and South Africa that we have managed to penetrate. In order to penetrate and sustain these markets, we had to improve the quality of our products by comparing them to imported products, which include *salaula*.

Maintenance of these foreign markets implies that the company has to move with time in all spheres of textile operations. This partly implies that the company has to keep upgrading its machinery and has indeed tried its best to do so.

As a result of trade liberalisation our company has also been forced to diversify. The company is now able to produce cooking oil from cotton seed, through a subsidiary firm. The objective of this move was to broaden the economic base of the company considering the fact that our business operation has peak and off-peak periods. We have also used garment manufacturing to mitigate our off peak period experiences of low returns due to low sales.”

Part 4: Overall impact of trade liberalization

Causal links between trade, development and poverty

The discussion of the linkages between trade, development and poverty in this section is based mainly on the views of the respondents in this study.⁵

This study found evidence of wide but varying knowledge of the stakeholders regarding the link between trade, development and poverty reduction. It is the study finding that there is serious controversy regarding the impact of trade liberalization on economic development and its expected net effects on the living standards of the people. The key respondents also admitted that these controversial views are held worldwide. For instance, Tekere observes that, “Trade liberalization is one of the key elements of economic structural adjustments packages sold to developing countries by the Breton Woods Institutions, the WTO, bilateral and multilateral donors. It lies in the heart of the ‘New Washington consensus’ and has long been championed as a panacea to low economic growth being experienced in developing countries.”

Achievements of South East Asia strongly support the view that export led growth policies serve as an engine for enhancing social welfare, human development, economic growth and development as well as serving as a mode for greater integration of these countries into the global economy. But contrary to such experiences, and particularly in Africa, there is conclusive evidence regarding the adverse role and impact of trade liberalization and globalization on human development, livelihoods, social welfare and economic development. Few African countries have benefited from trade liberalization (World Bank 1995, 1996) while in a number of cases liberalization was followed by misery, increased hardships, deterioration of human development, destruction of poor peoples’ livelihoods, environment, high rates of inequality, marginalization of poor of countries and their communities.

The general view of the respondents in this study was that trade liberalization has had a direct casual link to poverty through the manner in which it has affected wages and employment, taxes and government spending and through the distribution of goods and services. The main channels through which trade shocks including trade liberalization have been transmitted into poverty

⁵ Discussion based on the literature is provided in the Overview paper

impacts may well be appreciated by using Winter's (2000) analytical scheme, which provides a conceptual framework for interpreting the casual link between trade policy and poverty.

Distribution channels

Before any good reaches the consumer it passes through many stages on its way to or from the border. Each of these stages attracts a cost through transportation and tariffs that most often are transferred to the consumer and in turn reduces the proportionate impacts that are supposed to be felt by the consumers.

Wages and employment

This was noted by all respondents as one key mechanism by which foreign shocks are translated into poverty impacts. In Zambia the effects of trade liberalization on the domestic enterprise immediately caught public attention. In this regard, the loss of jobs resulting from privatization, acting hand in glove with trade liberalization, was the most common reason.

Taxes and spending

Winter (ibid) observes that, "A major fear, although not universally justified by any means, is that trade liberalization reduces government revenue. If the compensatory increases in other taxes or decreases in expenditure impinged heavily on the poor, poverty could be exacerbated." Many respondents observed that a number of companies have either gone under or have relocated since the advent of trade liberalization and thus viewed this situation in terms of the potential revenue that would have accrued to government had these companies continued to operate.

Other views and counterinterviews

The study, however, also found some counter views to the above causal link between trade liberalization and poverty. The supporters of trade liberalization generally maintained that in a globalizing world liberalizing trade was inevitable. They further argued that trade liberalization was a good policy in that it raises the income of the poor by raising overall income, with insignificant effects on the distribution of income.⁶

Among the most significant findings of the survey is that stakeholders' support for trade liberalization in fact remains strong. All the people interviewed were in favour of trade liberalization but were against the manner in which it was implemented in Zambia. They observed that trade liberalization should have been implemented slowly and with extra caution to allow local industries to adapt to the liberalized environment.

Liberalization should have been implemented over a period of time. Opening up to trade meant that Zambian industries had to make adjustments to deal with greater international competition. Thus, the government should have begun by building capacity in all the domestic firms, by way of re-evaluating the existing capital as a deliberate measure of the ability of the local industries to adapt to greater international competition that was necessitated by trade liberalization.

One of the strongest messages respondents voiced was that local industries were not prepared for competition necessitated by trade liberalization, and thus needed support in terms of easier access to credit in order to enable them to restructure their operations to suit the new environment. The

⁶ Some respondents admitted that it may not be possible for them to provide statistics to justify their views.

government overlooked the fact the local industries required re-orientation to enable them to withstand competition that was brought about by trade liberalization. The local industries initially enjoyed lucrative domestic markets under a protected economy. Since the advent of the free market doctrine of trade liberalization, which has seen the lifting of restrictions on imports, the domestic market has experienced an excessive supply of imported products that are sold cheaply due to their lower production cost structures as compared to those of our local products. This problem is exacerbated by Zambia's geographical position. Zambia is a landlocked country and thus local industries do not have ease access to other foreign markets and if they do they incur huge inland transportation costs.

There is need to review the cost structures of many other inputs, which include electricity in order to help the local industries enjoy the benefits of close proximity to local producers of these inputs. Our electricity for instance, is hydro-produced and should therefore be reasonably cheap. By so doing we will be able to counter the natural disadvantages that Zambia is faced with.

Most of the respondents observed that following the general decline in the buying power of the population domestic demand for most local products has significantly reduced in the last well over 10 years of trade liberalization.

The respondents observed that most of the industries that have gone under especially the parastatal companies, would not have survived even in the absence of privatization. From this point of view it is not accurate to conclude that trade liberalisation led to loss of employment to a number of people because more jobs would still have been lost had privatization not taken place. What is a more realistic conclusion therefore is that as a result of trade liberalisation there has been a creation of more real and sustainable employment. In addition there has been an increase in the total volume of economic activities amongst the local people, especially the poor who are engaged in various other activities due to ramification of other core economic activities into the informal sector. For instance, from by-products such as cotton and lint waste as well as off-cuts, small-time businessmen are able to make various items in the range of furniture, mattresses, doormats, mops etc. In addition, the influx of a wide variety of goods on the local markets has bred another category of small-time businessmen who are engaged in the redistribution of some of these goods through repacking.

The general view that the appreciation of the kwacha has had detrimental effects on the income levels of export-oriented businesses was also overwhelming. The respondents observed that while they realise that it has benefited some people there is need for the government to quickly look at the tradeoffs of the kwacha appreciation. There is technically very little that the gain in the strength of the kwacha has done to drive down the production costs to warrant any reduction in the general price levels. This is especially so in the case of those industries with bulky inventories that takes a long period to consume. Besides, these are materials that were acquired at an old exchange rate and thus, it would not make any business sense to arbitrarily reduce the price just because of the current strength of the kwacha. The respondents were not only uncertain about the sustainability of the strength of the kwacha but pointed to the view that such fluctuations in the exchange rate tends to introduce speculations in the economy, a situation which may undermine business. They observed that we have a few lessons to learn from, which include the South African experience of the appreciation of the Rand on the local economy.

How one company has been affected by a 'strong' kwacha

“Our company has been severely affected by trade liberalisation in a number of ways. First and foremost, it would be important to note that our company has two cash flow streams namely, the dollar and kwacha cash flow streams. Our company is disadvantaged in meeting kwacha expenses because it is not receiving sufficient kwacha from trading on the domestic market. The dollar cash flow stream equally gets negatively affected when there are serious fluctuations in the exchange rate, as is the situation today. We are made to understand that the kwacha is gaining strength for two reasons. Firstly, that there has been debt forgiveness and therefore government’s demand for kwacha has substantially reduced because it doesn’t have to service debt. Secondly, the effect of high copper prices implies that more dollars are coming in and thus market forces are making the kwacha stronger. So, for an export-oriented industry like ours, this situation has a negative impact in that the company is making less money.

In our view, the kwacha has been overvalued causing imports to become much cheaper, and our export drive to start tapering off, and if this situation persists, our company will become unviable. This situation is artificial in the sense that the spill over positive effect of the strength of the kwacha is supposed to be transmitted to our industry and many others, through reduced production costs. Many times that the strength of the kwacha has dropped, the resultant effect has been to increase the cost of key production inputs such as labour (in terms of wages), electricity and petroleum products and thus generally raising the rate of inflation. The reverse of this situation is rarely if at all, enjoyed by the local industries. For instance, there has never been a reduction in wages due to an increase in the strength of the kwacha. In any case, our wages are much higher than those obtaining in similar mills in India for instance.

The foregoing being the state of affairs, you cannot expect our industries to remain competitive with the globalisation of today’s world.”

The respondents acknowledged the view that a number of industries were sacrificed in the process of liberalising but a few have also come on board. So what the government needs to realise is that most of these industries are still in their infancy and thus need protection to grow and become competitive.

The respondents pointed to the need for government to promote effective public-private partnership. Government must realise that private-sector-led growth requires that there is coherence in policy and activities at all levels between the public and the private sector. To this end the respondents were happy to note that government is currently reviewing a policy document that will promote policy coherence and adequately take care of the needs of the private sector’s development strategy.

The respondents also pointed to some institutional flaws such as the difficulties faced when VAT claims are due. The government has made a number of products including milk VAT exempt. This has been good on paper but not quite in practice. It has been extremely difficult to claim this VAT and this practice has simply introduced distortions in that this VAT is viewed as an added cost of production that is transferred to the consumers through inequitable pricing.

There was a hostile view pertaining to the current labor laws. There was consensus on the view that liberalisation was implemented in piecemeal in the sense that the labor market for instance, is still not liberalized. Trade unions still have a great influence in industrial relations and this situation has destroyed the general work culture in Zambia. Employers have developed an antagonistic attitude towards their employees because they are too protected by their Trade Unions.

Many of the respondents observed that the general situation in Zambia today is that most financial institutions are ready to avail credit to local investors, but the cost of borrowing as reflected by the high lending rates in excess of 40 percent per annum, makes it prohibitive to borrow. In this sense credit would be said to be unavailable. The respondents also observed that this problem has been compounded by persistent high inflation rates, which further reduces the revenue bases of the individual industries and thus rendering them unable to service their existing debt obligations. In the long-term these industries are unable to re-capitalize, and thus fail to match the current technology required to keep them competitive.

Part 5: Conclusions and recommendations

Conclusions

The study findings clearly demonstrate the stakeholders' general view that while they acknowledge trade liberalisation as a good policy that has been adopted world wide, they do not support the manner in which its implementation in Zambia was rushed.

Our findings suggest that generally speaking most closures of our local industries appear to have been caused by opening up of the markets to international imports and also by the stiff domestic competition promoted by trade liberalisation. Consequently, redundancies emanating from liquidations and privatization of parastatal companies contributed to the deterioration in the living standards of the people.

As earlier alluded to trade liberalization aimed at creating a competitive and productive economy, which would be driven by private sector initiative with a view to enhance living standards for Zambians. Contrary of these expectations the stakeholders' general view is that since the advent of trade liberalisation the Zambian economy has been characterized by increased hardships among the poor, destruction of infrastructure and hence the environment. The number of firms have been closed is higher than that of the ones that have come on board. Thus, the rate of unemployment has increased resulting in the general decline in the purchasing power of the people. The income gap between the rich and the poor has widened resulting in increased inequality and marginalization of the poor. In summary, poverty has actually increased as opposed to the expected benefits of trade liberalisation.

However, notwithstanding the above shocks, since the advent of trade liberalisation the Zambian economy has witnessed the emergency of small scale entrepreneurs who are mostly middlemen and those engaged in re-processing and thus providing some form of employment and income to the poor.

Recommendations

Zambia should take extra caution when signing any international trade protocols because most of her industries are in their infant state and thus cannot absorb the shocks of having to compete with giant foreign counterparts including some of those in the region. This implies that Zambia

does not seem to have the supply side capacity to exploit the opportunities that would be given under any international agreement. Foreign products have led to the closure of a number of local industries and thus Zambia has had a good lesson from which to prevent further adverse impacts.

Thus, Zambia must re-assess the gains from some of the trade agreements that have already been signed under COMESA and SADC. The benefits have so far not been overwhelming;⁷ hence the need to defer those agreements that have not yet come into effect such as the SADC trade protocols due to come into effect in 2008. For instance, we should realize the danger of 100% removal of duty on wheat, under the SADC trade protocol. Once this agreement is effected Zambia's traditional market will be dominated by foreign industries from giant economies like South Africa. These international trade protocols have introduced unfair trade practices that have in turn killed local production, hence the need for a more strategic approach.

The business community in Zambia has also taken too long to adjust to the liberalized environment. This slow process of adjustment is largely attributable to government failure to provide the necessary direction like has been the case with a few sectors, which include among others the agricultural, the transport and the financial sectors. The financial sector for instance, had over the years remained widely underdeveloped, but has in the recent years improved and is able to harness local savings to support investment although the cost of borrowing is still high.

It should be realized that trade liberalisation is just one necessary condition for economic growth and not a sufficient condition to reduce poverty, especially given the asymmetrical relationship between economic growth and poverty reduction. Generally the objective function of most businesses is to maximize profits and thus in order for trade liberalisation to benefit the poor there has to be coherence between trade policies and national development policies.

⁷ As an example, Kenya does not pay duty on oil but Zambia pays 15%.

References

Chikoti, S. and Mtonga (2002), Country paper on textiles and clothing in Zambia, Ministry of Commerce, Trade and Industry, Lusaka.

Export Board of Zambia (2000), *Zambia Supply Survey on Textiles and Clothing*, Lusaka

Hansen T. K., 2000. *Salaula: The World of Secondhand Clothing and Zambia*, The University of Chicago Press, Chicago, USA

Henriot P., 2000. *Salaula: The World of Secondhand Clothing and Zambia*, Book review in African Social Research, University of Zambia, UNZA Press.

Rubin M. and E. Mudenda, 2001. *SADC Study of Textile and Garment Industries*, Report of the Study Commissioned by SADC.

Seshamani, V., 2006. Linkages between trade, development and poverty reduction in Zambia: An overview, Revised report prepared for the TDP project of CUTS, Lusaka.

Tekere M., (2001), “Trade Liberalisation under structural economic adjustment – impact on social welfare in Zimbabwe” A paper for the Poverty Reduction Forum, SAPRI, Zimbabwe.

Winter, L.A., 2000, “Trade, trade policy and poverty: What are the links?” Discussion Paper No. 2382, London.

World Bank (1995), “Zimbabwe consolidating the Trade liberalisation”. World Bank, international trade Division, International Economics Department.

World Bank (1996), “Poverty in Zimbabwe: Current issues and knowledge for the future”. Mimeo.

Appendix

Firms selected in the agro-processing sector

Specialty Foods Zambia Limited

1. Snacks,
2. Corn puffs
3. Peanut butter
4. Baking powder
5. Custard powder
6. Soya baby porridges
7. Honey
8. Vinegar

Amanita Group of Companies

1. Cooking oil

2. Rice
3. Snacks
4. Salt
5. Meal

National Milling Corporation

1. Mealie meal (break fast and roller meal)
2. Flour (break, cake, delight flour)
3. Maize bran
4. Castle grit
5. Maize samp
6. A variety of stock fees

Parmalat

1. Plain milk
2. Flavored milk
3. Cabana
4. Lacto milk.
5. Yoghurts
6. Two ranges of juices

Hybrid Poultry Farm

1. Chickens
2. Eggs

Firms selected in the Textiles sector

Zambia-China Mulungushi Textiles Joint Venture Limited

1. Cotton ginning
2. Spinning
3. Fabric weaving and knitting

Excel Textile Mills Limited

1. Cotton ginning
2. Spinning
3. Fabric weaving and knitting

Mukuba Textiles Limited

1. Spinning
2. Fabric weaving and knitting

Kafue Textiles Limited

1. Spinning
2. Fabric weaving and knitting

Swarp Spinning Mills

1. Spinning
2. Fabric weaving and knitting
3. Garments

Sankiza Spinning Limited

1. Spinning

Gloria Knitting Company Limited

1. Fabric weaving and knitting

Caress Lingerie

1. Garments

Key personnel interviewed

- Executive Director, Zambia Association of Chambers of Commerce and Industry, ZACCI, Lusaka
- Chairman, Zambia Association of Manufacturers, ZAM, Lusaka
- Mark O'Donnell, Managing Director, Union Gold Zambia Limited, Lusaka
- Murray Sanderson, Hon. Secretary, ZIPPA
- A.E. Chembe, Economist, Zambia National Farmers Union, ZNFU
- One senior Government representative, Ministry of Commerce, Trade & Industry
- Chairman, Economics Association of Zambia, Lusaka (to check if they have commissioned any research work on the project theme)