

Inception Report

Gender Dimensions of Trade Facilitation Agreement: Evidence from Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Nepal

Case of Women Led/Managed/Owned Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs)

Contents

1	Background.....	2
2	Literature Review	2
3	Scope of work	6
4	Main Activities under Project	12
5	Ongoing Activities	15
6	References.....	16
7	Annexure – I: Detailed Work Plan with Timeline.....	18
8	Annexure –II: Project Activity Log frame for Monitoring And Evaluation (M&E)	21

Supported by



Country Partners



November 2018

1 Background

Economic empowerment of women is necessary in achieving inclusive economic growth and sustainable socio-economic development. More participation of women in economic activities will reduce gender inequality and contribute in overall economic development. Participation of women in trade activities will additionally benefit, assuming that trade is an engine of economic growth.

The main reasons of very less participation of women in economic activities are lack of access to opportunities and existing barriers. These barriers include: backward social system, inequalities in labour market such as unequal access to jobs & differences in remuneration at work in relation to male counterparts, violence at work (physical, emotional, sexual), discrimination at office, and unequal division of unpaid care and domestic work, among others.

Goal 5 of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of United Nations (UN) emphasise on gender equality by ending all forms of discrimination against women and girls and empowering them economically through their participation in economic activities. It is believed that empowering women will have a multiplier effect and help in achieving inclusive economic growth with better socioeconomic development.

In December 2017, at WTO Ministerial Conference in Buenos Aires, 118 WTO members and observers have agreed to put collective efforts in curbing gender discrimination and start the same by emphasising on building gender inclusive trade and development policies. Joint declaration on ‘Trade and Women’s Economic Empowerment’ has been issued in which all WTO members and observers have agreed to collaborate on making trade and development policies more gender responsive. This declaration on women and trade emphasised on removing barriers to foster women empowerment.

2 Literature Review

2.1 Gender Parity and Women Empowerment

Gender Equality has been set as one of the achieving goals under UN’s SDG-5. This is based on the fact that women are discriminated in most of economic processes throughout the world. This discriminating behaviour against women is inherent and has

been perpetuated through social norms and customs. However, gender equality is an integral part of a developed economy and is necessary for inclusive growth. Women empowerment and economic development are closely related. Economic development itself leads to women empowerment. Also, empowered women can contribute in development of the economy through their involvement in decision making (Duflo, 2012).

Moorosi (2012) in his study documented that gender equality approach of providing good education and skill development to women in South Africa can only alleviate poverty and entail development. Providing education among women can contribute in efficient human capital. It has been observed in many less developed and developing countries that women are being deprived to get good education and having fewer opportunities to participate in skill development programmes.

Mitra *et al.* (2015) in their study using the unbalanced panel of 101 countries verified that gender equality in economic opportunities and outcome has significant positive impact on growth.

2.2 Role of MSME in Women Economic Empowerment

Participation of women through Micro-Small-Medium Enterprises (MSME) is one of the ways to integrate women in economic activities. Women themselves can establish unit of their own or they can be absorbed in others units as labourers. Different developed and developing countries' governments also endorsed the significant role of MSMEs in economic development and women empowerment.

Tambunan (2007) in his study documented that Indonesian Government has been supporting to develop small and medium enterprises, not only because it plays crucial role in economic development also it helps to develop women entrepreneurs, particularly in rural areas. In this study, it has been found that growth of MSMEs and local economic development are positively correlated.

Further, Fiseha & Oyelana (2015) in their study confirmed this by utilizing data from 50 SMEs in the Eastern Cape Province of Africa and stated that SMEs have been contributing immensely in local economic development by generating employment,

mainly for low skilled, differently abled and marginalised women and thus, alleviating poverty and improving living standards of poor households.

At macro level, the same positive relation between growth of SMEs and economic development has been found. Beck *et al.* (2005) in their study tested the hypotheses whether the increase in the share of formal employment in SMEs lead to economic growth, reduction in poverty and inequality. The study found significant positive impact of increase in employment in SMEs on economic growth by utilizing cross-country data of 45 countries.

In another study by Obi *et al.* (2018), conducted in three different states of transition economy Nigeria, found significant contribution of MSMEs in job creation, poverty alleviation and improvement in standard of living. MSMEs have significant contribution in terms of job creation even if the economy is stagnant (Mead & Liedholm, 1998).

2.3 Challenges Faced by Women Entrepreneurs

Women entrepreneurs are suffering from access to external finance while expanding their existing venture and new ones. Existing research, conducted in developed and developing countries, has presented multiple reasons of paucity of finance to women entrepreneurs.

Similarly, Klapper & Parker (2010) in their study documented restrictive business regulatory environment in developing and transition economies that restrict women to enter into high growth potential capital intensive sector. They remain in labour intensive and informal sector. Women entrepreneurs facing difficulties in getting formal loan due to discriminatory behaviour of financial institutions, laws and regulations raise collateral issues, misperception about women, low business experience, and prone to use of disburse loan in other activities. Restrictive and cumbersome business procedures force women to invest in informal sector.

On the other hand, in a study by Sena *et al.* (2012), conducted in England, inferred that lack of financial literacy of women arise from low educational qualification, and risk averse nature deter them to use external finance in their own venture. In addition, Madill *et al.* (2012) in their study found by investigating the relation between banking services and men & women managed SMEs utilizing Surveys of Financing of Small- and

Medium-sized Enterprises Administered across Canada during the fall of 2001 and 2002 that women owned firms are less likely to apply for loan because they are mainly home-based firm, and not investing in R&D, and even if they apply for loan are likely to be turned down because they have less ratio of earning to loan size, less business experience, poor credit history, insufficient collateral, and most important factor is not having good relation with Banking institutes.

Shah (2013) in her study shows the sociocultural factors as main barriers behind women participation in entrepreneurial activities in India. This includes challenge in combining work and family life. Lack of awareness about financial instruments is another challenge restricting women to become entrepreneurs. Overall, the study recommends the creation of more enabling environment for women entrepreneurs in India by specifying the roles of various organizations and agencies.

In a recent study, conducted in four different parts of Bangladesh by Ghosh *et al.* (2017), found collateral dispute and fail to undergo lengthy application process are the main reasons of inaccessibility of formal loan. Other than that, commercial banks' officials stated that women entrepreneurs apply very small loan which is not profitable for their banks and most of the time they use this amount to satisfy household needs or needs of male member(s) of their house.

2.4 Enabling Participation of Women in International Trade

Women entrepreneurs, investing in home-based firm with small size are not able to participate in international trade. As discussed above, financial constraints are integral to deter them in investing R&D activities and expand their ventures further to access foreign markets. In addition, women entrepreneurs are more likely to have no knowledge about trade process and procedures and having protectionist view in the context of globalization. Cumbersome and complex trade procedures encouraged women to involve in informal trade. *"Smuggling may not be an outcome of taxes but rather an attempt to circumvent the cumbersome web of government regulations and controls that often make trade through formal channels very difficult"* (Taneja, 2001).

Different countries' governments have taken different trade facilitation measures (TFMs) to ease the trade process and procedures. WTO members also concluded negotiations on Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA) at 2013 Bali Ministerial Conference.

However, policymakers are unable to frame gender-mainstreaming trade facilitation measures.

Gender Dimension of trade is a researchable topic and very few studies are available on it. Research on this topic is also difficult due to unavailability of disaggregated gender specific data. Literature has focused mainly on women's role as a labourer and ignored other roles such as consumers and entrepreneurs in international trade domain (Shepherd and Stone, 2017). In a recent study by Taneja *et al.* (2018), conducted in our study region BBIN, investigated current participation of and hurdles faced by women traders and entrepreneurs in three different channels of trade process: trade in formal channel through LCSs of North East region (NER) of India and North Bengal with Bangladesh, Bhutan, and Nepal; trade through four Border Haats of India with Bangladesh; and extra-legal informal trade through formal channels and illegal channel as well. This paper highlighted miniscule participation of women in formal channel of trade and absence of any gender mainstreaming trade facilitation measures in South Asia.

3 Scope of work

3.1 Statement of the Problem

The sub-region containing the BBIN countries has a conspicuous lack of women entrepreneurs. Research has shown that women working in trade and trade related activities tend to be at the lowest levels: as labourers, working at informal sector; and ownership are disproportionately in the hands of men. Social expectations and traditions, along with lack of access to resources are common reasons for women not being able to participate in economic activities to the extent that men do.

It is believed that women participation in trade related activities can be encouraged by making gender-inclusive trade policies. Trade facilitation measures (TFMs) must be gender responsive in order to encourage more participation of women in international trade. The WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA), as signed by the BBIN countries, is also a gender-neutral document where no separate regulations have been specified for facilitating trade by women traders. Implementation of trade facilitation without carefully considering their gender implications may lead to high entry barriers for women traders in trade activities.

There exist significant differences in the real situations of men and women in this sub-region. Indicators of development such as gender-disaggregated literacy rates, the global gender gap ranking, as well as the World Bank group's enterprise survey on female entrepreneurship show a clear trend limiting women's development in the sub-region. There is a clear need for assessment of market entry barriers to ensure increased market access for women entrepreneurs.

3.2 Research Questions

There is a need to identify the barriers and factors that are responsible for less participation of women in economic activities, particularly in developing countries. On this basis, following research questions have been identified:

1. What are the major hurdles faced by women entrepreneurs (existing/potential) in the BBIN sub-region?
2. How can TFMs help to reduce or remove hurdles faced by women traders in BBIN?
3. How does the TFA take gender-specific hurdles into account? and
4. What country-specific adjustments are required to make TFA work for women traders?

3.3 Objectives of the Study

Goal: Collect evidence from women led/managed/owned Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) to study the gender dimensions of trade facilitation agreement in Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.

The study has following objectives:

1. Identifying the existing barriers (low level of financial & digital inclusion among women and hurdles at selected land ports faced by women traders) that limit women entrepreneurs to access opportunities to engage in economic activities, particularly in trade.
2. Conduct gender based analysis of TFMs given in TFA.
3. Create awareness on gender-inclusive trade facilitation in Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.

4. Suggest country-specific policy recommendations in favour of women responsive TFA in particular and trade policy in general for better participation of women in trade and trade related activities.

3.4 Working Assumptions

The project will be undertaken in a consortium approach with CUTS partners across Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal. The project duration is estimated to be of 24 months and will be conducted in two phases – i) Collecting evidence; and ii) Creating awareness (see Annexure-I for detailed work plan).

3.4.1 Type of Stakeholders

Women entrepreneurs (including traders) who ideally fulfil any of the following eligibility criteria:

- She should own or lead or manage an enterprise based in Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal.
- She should be engaged in trade (domestic or international).
- The enterprise must fulfil the conditions for the respective national guidelines and definitions for micro, small and medium enterprises.

The list of identified women entrepreneurs/traders will be used during field survey for interviewing them to understand challenges faced during their participation in income generating activities, role of trade activity, and the existing gender specific gaps in trade facilitation.

3.4.2 Research Instruments

- Semi-structured Interviews
- Interview schedules
- Type of Sampling method (Non-Random Sampling)

3.4.3 Sample Size

- The scoping visit will identify the locations to be visiting for the final field survey: at least 5 from each country, and at least 12 in case of India

- Sample size for each country: at least 40 women from Bhutan & Nepal, 75 women from Bangladesh and 100 women in case of India. Additionally, government officials and officials involved in trade process will also be a part of total sample. Country-wise figures will be decided using sampling technique on the basis of country-specific desk research.

3.5 Methodology for Collecting Data

Step 1: Identification of concerned stakeholders – In the very first stage, we will identify the concerned stakeholders’ as mentioned in 3.4.1. This stage also includes the recording of locations where they are easily available for the interview.

Step 2: Preparation of Interview Schedule – The second step is to prepare separate interview schedule for each type of stakeholders’ identified in step 1. The interview schedule will include relative mix of close and open ended questions to capture socio-economic factors, logistical procedures, and infrastructural issues through semi-structured interviews of all sampled stakeholders’.

Step 3: Pilot Survey/Scoping Visits – Under scoping visits, two locations from each country will be visited. These locations will be identified from the literature review, and in consultation with the PAC members. Additionally, two major border points of all the four countries will be visited to understand the current infrastructural situation and country-specific trade environment for women traders - within the border, at the border and beyond the borders. This stage will help in updating the interview schedule for final round of interviews.

Step 4: Determination of Appropriate Sample Size – To determine appropriate sample size, we will rely on step-wise methodology of sampling design as follows:

- **Define the target population:** 255 women (specified in section 3.4.3) and other stakeholders.
- **Sampling technique:** We will rely on non-probability sampling which is based on the judgement of the researcher to determine appropriate proportion of each type of stakeholder (types of women entrepreneurs on the basis of micro, small, medium enterprises; other stakeholders involved in trade process). Specifically, the study will rely on following sampling techniques covered under non-random

sampling: a) Convenience sampling; b) Judgmental sampling; c) Quota sampling; and d) Snowball sampling.

Step 5: Data Collection and Data Entry – After determining the sample size for each type of stakeholders', the next stage is data collection and its entry using application software (MS Excel).

3.6 Methodology for the Analysis

The study aims to use the qualitative data analysis (QDA) to analyse the primary information received from the field survey. QDA will provide the results on the basis of experiences and views of the concerned stakeholders. Country-specific cases will be presented finally in a project report to highlight country-specific hurdles faced by women entrepreneurs. These case studies will provide the solutions of their problems from their own perspective.

All the information will be collected through field visits. The points taken from Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), such as stakeholder consultations, will also be a part of the analysis. These FGDs will be conducted at strategic nodes within as well as outside the corridors to know the perception and views from the larger perspective. This will help in understanding the situation at macro level.

Solutions from women respondents will also be discussed through FGDs with policy makers and other macro level stakeholders' to convert them into feasible policy recommendations. All the recommendations would be divided into three categories as per the required time frame for their implementation.

While preparing the case studies, the study will use various statistical tools (tests of hypothesis and indices) to analyse the level of financial and digital inclusion among surveyed women.

The study will also highlight the sectors where there is a possibility of establishing value chains. Women traders will be interviewed to know what problems they are currently facing while trading and possible problems they may face while expanding their business beyond the borders. This will help them to join Regional Value Chains (RVCs) which can further help to upgrade their production scale and quality and leads to their economic empowerment.

One guidance note prepared by Higgins (2012) demonstrates that gender matters for trade facilitation and logistics and also given the way to integrate the gender dimensions into trade facilitation and logistic initiatives. The study will use this guidance note to evaluate the existing situation of trade facilitation initiatives and suggest appropriate policy actions to add gender dimensions into the existing one.

3.7 Expected Output

The study is expected to achieve the following outputs:

1. Country-specific evidence on barriers faced by women entrepreneurs in conducting their business.
2. Country-wise recommendations to modify the text of TFA for BBIN countries in such a way that it becomes gender responsive.
3. Guide to prepare gender responsive trade policies in BBIN countries to promote women traders. This will help in achieving the target set in WTO Ministerial Conference in Buenos Aires in 2017.

3.8 Expected Outcomes

1. Awareness among women entrepreneurs (existing and potential) in BBIN on possible RVCs and their importance in their socioeconomic development in particular and of entire sub-region in general.
2. Awareness about TFA and the benefits of gender responsive trade policies to women economic empowerment in BBIN.
3. More participation of women in trade and trade related activities in BBIN, if gender-responsive TFA would be implemented as per the study's recommendations.

3.9 Deliverables

Final report including problem statement, objectives, rationale, literature review, summary of stakeholders consultation meetings, data analysis on the basis of primary and secondary data, findings of the study, policy recommendations, and the future avenues of work related to involvement of women in international trade in BBIN-Sub region in particular and South Asia in general.

3.10 Chapter Scheme

S.N.	Chapter Title	Description
1	Introduction	This will include the introduction of the project theme with literature review followed by rationale, objectives, and implementation plan of the study.
2	National Level Policies to Encourage Women Participation in Economic Activities	This will include briefly the national level initiatives to empower women in economic activities. This chapter will provide the knowledge on existing initiatives, gaps in the existing policies, and guide in providing appropriate policy recommendations by mixing the knowledge from desk and field.
3	MSME and Women Entrepreneurs: Case of Bangladesh	This will provide field level evidence on existing barriers to women economic empowerment on the basis of evidence from the field, case studies on success stories from the field, cases of potential entrepreneurs on the basis of desk research on possible existence of RVCs among BBIN countries in particular, and South Asia in general.
4	MSME and Women Entrepreneurs: Case of Bhutan	
5	MSME and Women Entrepreneurs: Case of India	
6	MSME and Women Entrepreneurs: Case of Nepal	
7	Policy Recommendations	This will include evidence based policy prescriptions/interventions to address the existing challenges/barriers that are limiting women access to opportunities while participating in economic activities.

4 Main Activities under Project

4.1 Activity 1

Constituting Project Advisory Committee & viewpoint papers: Under this activity, CUTS has selected 12 Project Advisory Committee (PAC) members (3 each from BBIN countries) as experts who will guide us throughout the implementation of the project. PAC members are selected on the basis of following criterion: He/She should be expert on issues pertaining to women led/managed/owned Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs); OR He/She should have knowledge on trade facilitation agreement and its implementation in Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal. Each member will contribute one small thematic viewpoint paper within first 12 months

specifically on respective country's issues related to those women entrepreneurs involved in trade activities within the sub-region. The publishing schedule of the viewpoint papers will be finalised in consultation with the PAC members. CUTS along with PAC will conduct two internal meetings during the project, one at the beginning of the project and second at the middle of the project.

4.2 Activity 2

Project inception meeting: CUTS will organise the project inception meeting at New Delhi including the participation from project partners in Bangladesh, Bhutan and Nepal. It will be one and half day meeting comprising one day deliberations on project theme and action plan followed by half-day meeting with PAC members to evaluate the intended progress of the project. CUTS will present other components of the project such as the project website, partner reporting formats, monitoring and evaluation plans, among others.

4.3 Activity 3

Literature Review and Scoping visits: CUTS and partners will undertake scoping visits after extensive review of literature and desk research. The findings from the literature review will also feed in strengthening the methodology of the project and identify various areas of intervention. It will also provide inputs to prepare the draft interview schedule for the scoping visits. Scoping visits will be kind of pilot survey which will highlight the remaining issues not covered in the draft schedule and also helps in revising the draft schedule to the final one. A part of literature review will also be presented at the project inception meeting.

4.4 Activity 4

Field surveys: CUTS and its country partners will undertake field survey and conduct interviews of selected women traders who perform formal trade beyond or within the border. CUTS will produce location specific reports aimed at specific awareness initiatives raising points on difficulties faced by the women traders.

4.5 Activity 5

Awareness generation meetings: CUTS and partners will identify key trading locations/trade hubs based on the commodities being traded by women led/managed/owned MSMEs (3 locations each in Bangladesh, Bhutan and Nepal and 6 locations in India, thus a total of 15 locations). Each meeting will comprise of 25 participants and will be organised at the identified trading location/trade hubs for information dissemination of available schemes for the benefit of women traders and creating a gender inclusive trade environment at the critical nodes/trade hubs. At these meetings, the four country-specific case studies of successful women traders and their trade initiatives in the region will also be presented and disseminated.

4.6 Activity 6

National policy dialogues: CUTS and partners will organise a one-day policy dialogue per country (total four dialogues across BBIN) to present the findings from country level case studies. These dialogues will include around 40 participants comprising of policy makers, trade regulators, women traders, chamber of commerce and industry representatives, civil society organisations and media houses, among others.

4.7 Activity 7

Research Report: CUTS will compile a consolidated research report with the project findings across BBIN countries from the scoping visits, field surveys, grassroots meetings and national policy dialogues. This report will categorise country-specific policy recommendations for ensuring a gender inclusive trade environment at specific locations in BBIN countries. The research report will be presented at the regional policy dialogue among diverse stakeholders from across BBIN countries.

4.8 Activity 8

Exposure Visits: CUTS and partners will also organise two exposure visits to create awareness among various women stakeholders about trade facilitation agreement. The participants of this visit will be comprised of relevant identified stakeholders throughout the field survey and other awareness generation programmes. Plan is to visit fair organised by SAARC Chamber of Commerce and Industry to pave way for greater trade and investment cooperation among SAARC member states, with gender

inclusive approach. Alternate plan is to visit successfully established women led enterprise in the sub region in case fair has been cancelled by the SAARC authorities.

4.9 Activity 9

Sharing regional experience at National/ International platform Or participation in Training/ Capacity Building programmes: CUTS will disseminate its findings from the BBIN region on gender issues related to trade at various platforms, both at national and international levels. Also, the team can participate at various subject related training and capacity building workshops.

4.10 Activity 10

Regional Policy Dialogue: CUTS and partners will organise a two days regional workshop at New Delhi/Kathmandu to present the research report among the stakeholders from BBIN countries. The regional policy dialogue will include around 100 participants from BBIN countries.

4.11 Activity 11

Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E): CUTS monitoring and evaluation team will carry out project deliverable monitoring throughout the project duration. At the end of the project, CUTS will undertake an evaluation to compile the monitoring and evaluation report. This activity will also be monitored via the project website listing key outputs of the project (see Annexure II for M&E Plan).

5 Ongoing Activities

5.1 Literature review

<<Please refer Section 2>>

5.2 Mapping of Partners and PAC Members

CUTS will undertake this study along with its country partners which are as follows:

- **Bangladesh:** Bangladesh Women Chamber of Commerce and Industry (BWCCI)
- **Bhutan:** Bhutan Media and Communication Institute (BMCI)
- **Nepal:** South Asia Watch on Trade, Economics, and Environment (SAWTEE)

Final list of PAC members will be shared soon.

5.3 Mapping of Stakeholders'

This is an ongoing activity.

CUTS team visited 'Women of India Organic Festival' at New Delhi on 23-24 October, 2018 and mapped around 30 women stakeholders' from various parts of India. List is with the Project team and the final list will be shared soon.

6 References

- Beck, Thorsten, Asli Demirguc-Kunt & Ross Levine. (2005). SMEs, Growth, and Poverty: Cross-Country Evidence. *Journal of Economic Growth*, Vol. 10, No. 3 (September 2005), pp. 199-229.
- Duflo, Esther. (2012). Women Empowerment and Economic Development. *Journal of Economic Literature*, Vol. 50, No. 4 (December 2012), pp. 1051-1079.
- Fiseha, G. G., & Oyelana, A. A. (2015). An Assessment of the Roles of Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) in the Local Economic Development (LED) in South Africa. *Journal of Economics*, Vol. 6, No. 3, pp. 280–290.
- Ghosh, P. K., Ghosh, S. K., & Chowdhury, S. (2017). Factors hindering women entrepreneurs' access to institutional finance- an empirical study. *Journal of Small Business & Entrepreneurship*, Vol. 30, No. 4, pp. 279–291.
- Higgins, K. (2012). Gender Dimensions of Trade Facilitation and Logistics: A Guidance Note. Washington, DC. © World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/16973> License: CC BY 3.0 IGO.
- Klapper, L. F., & Parker, S. C. (2010). Gender and the Business Environment for New Firm Creation. *The World Bank Research Observer*, Vol. 26, No. 2, pp. 237–257.
- Madill, J. J., Riding, A. L., & Haines, G. H. (2006). Women Entrepreneurs: Debt Financing and Banking Relationships. *Journal of Small Business & Entrepreneurship*, Vol. 19, No. 2, pp. 121–142.
- Mead, D. C., & Liedholm, C. (1998). The dynamics of micro and small enterprises in developing countries. *World Development*, Vol. 26, No. 1, pp. 61–74.

- Mitra, A., Bang, J. T., & Biswas, A. (2014). Gender Equality and Economic Growth: Is it Equality of Opportunity or Equality of Outcomes? *Feminist Economics*, Vol. 21, No. 1, pp. 110–135.
- Moorosi, P. (2009). Gender, skills development and poverty reduction. *Empowering women for gender equity*, Vol 23, No. 81, pp. 110-117.
- Obi, J., Ibidunni, A. S., Tolulope, A., Olokundun, M. A., Amaihian, A. B., Borishade, T. T., & Fred, P. (2018). Contribution of small and medium enterprises to economic development: Evidence from a transiting economy. *Data in Brief*, 18, pp. 835–839.
- Ramadani, V. (2015). The Woman Entrepreneur in Albania: An Exploratory Study on Motivation, Problems and Success Factors. *Journal of Balkan and Near Eastern Studies*, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp. 204–221.
- Sena, V., Scott, J., & Roper, S. (2010). Gender, borrowing patterns and self-employment: some evidence for England. *Small Business Economics*, Vol. 38, No. 4, pp. 467–480.
- Shah, H. (2013). Creating an Enabling Environment for Women's Entrepreneurship in India. *Development papers No. 1304*, South and South-West Asia Office, Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, New Delhi – India.
- Shepherd, B., Stone, S. (2017). Trade and Women. *Asian Development Bank, Working Paper No: 648*.
- Tambunan, T. (2007). Development of SME and Women Entrepreneurs in a Developing Country: The Indonesian Story. *Small Enterprise Research*, Vol. 15, No. 2, pp. 31–51.
- Taneja, N. (2001). Informal Trade in SAARC Region. *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 36, No. 11, pp. 959-964.
- Taneja, N., Joshi, S., Prakash, S., & Bimal, S. (2018). Trade facilitation measures to enhance women's participation in cross-border trade in BBIN. *Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations (ICRIER), Working Paper, No. 350*.
- Watson, J. (2006). External funding and firm growth: Comparing female-and male-controlled SMEs. *Venture Capital*, Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 33–49.

7 Annexure – I: Detailed Work Plan with Timeline

S.N.	Activities/ Deliverables*	Quarter 1 Oct 18 to Dec 18			Quarter 2 Jan 19 to Mar 19			Quarter 3 Apr 19 to Jun 19			Quarter 4 Jul 19 to Sep 19			Quarter 5 Oct 19 to Dec 19			Quarter 6 Jan 20 to Mar 20			Quarter 7 Apr 20 to Jun 20			Quarter 8 Jul 20 to Sep 20		
		M1	M2	M3																					
1	Project Inception report (Preparation and Submission)		D1																						
2	Organise Inception Meeting at Kathmandu																								
3	Organise PAC meeting at Kathmandu																								
4	Submission of Inception Meeting Report																								
5	Submission of PAC Meeting report			D2																					
6	Preparation of Draft Interview Schedule																								
7	Scoping visit as a pilot survey in BBIN																								
8	Report of scoping visits																								

S.N.	Activities/ Deliverables*	Quarter 1 Oct 18 to Dec 18			Quarter 2 Jan 19 to Mar 19			Quarter 3 Apr 19 to Jun 19			Quarter 4 Jul 19 to Sep 19			Quarter 5 Oct 19 to Dec 19			Quarter 6 Jan 20 to Mar 20			Quarter 7 Apr 20 to Jun 20			Quarter 8 Jul 20 to Sep 20				
		M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3	M1	M2	M3		
9	Revision of Draft Interview Schedule						D3																				
10	Field work in BBIN									D4																	
11	Field reports from BBIN												D5														
12	View point papers by PAC members				We will ask PAC members to start working on viewpoint papers and complete by September 2019 (12 in total, one per PAC member)																						
13	Submission of draft policy briefs (four in total)													One per country (D6)													
14	Exposure Visit and Its report													Exposure visit includes capacity building of at least 40 women from BBIN countries. It can be split into two parts depending upon the future circumstances.													
15	Organising awareness generation workshops (15)																Bangladesh - 3 Bhutan - 3 India - 6 Nepal - 3										
16	Submission of Workshops reports																	D7									
17	National Policy Dialogues (four in total)																		One per country								
18	Submission of NPD reports																					D8					
19	Regional																										

S.N.	Activities/ Deliverables*	Quarter 1 Oct 18 to Dec 18			Quarter 2 Jan 19 to Mar 19			Quarter 3 Apr 19 to Jun 19			Quarter 4 Jul 19 to Sep 19			Quarter 5 Oct 19 to Dec 19			Quarter 6 Jan 20 to Mar 20			Quarter 7 Apr 20 to Jun 20			Quarter 8 Jul 20 to Sep 20					
		M1	M2	M3																								
	Policy Dialogue - 1																											
20	Submission of RPD report																											
21	Final report submission																											
22	M&E report submission																											D9

* The timeline for all the activities are tentative and subject to change within the total time period of the project. The report of all the activities will be submitted to DFID for comments; **D**: Major Deliverables.

8 Annexure –II: Project Activity Log frame for Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E)

Trade Facilitation Agreement and Women Entrepreneurship: Evidence from Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Nepal

Overall Goal - Collect evidence from women led/managed/owned Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) to study the gender dimensions of trade facilitation agreement in Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal

Expected Output	Objectives (to achieve Output)	Activity	Indicator	Instrument	Means of Verification	Where to publish	Target Number (to be achieved)	Baseline (Quarter 1)	Milestone 1 (Quarter 4)	Milestone 2 (Quarter 8)
Output 1 - Country-specific evidence on barriers/hurdles faced by women entrepreneurs in conducting their business	Objective 1 - Identify the existing barriers (low level of financial inclusion among women; and hurdles faced at land ports for cross-border trade) that limit women entrepreneurs to access opportunities to engage in economic activities, particularly in trade	Activity 1: Compilation of the Project Advisory Committee	1.1: Number of Project Advisors	Memorandum of Understanding and terms of reference with PAC members	List of PAC members	Project File	12	12	12	12
			1.2: Number of viewpoint papers		Viewpoint papers		12	-	12	-
			1.3: Number of PAC meetings		Minutes of the meetings		2	1	1	-
		Activity 2: Project inception meeting	2.1: Number of participants	Memorandum of Understanding and terms of reference with Country Partners	List of participants	Project File and Website	25	25	-	-
			2.2: Number of project inception meetings		Minutes of the meetings		1	1	-	-
		Activity 3: Scoping visits	3.1: Number of scoping visits	Draft Interview Schedule	Field reports	Project File	4 locations per country	-	4 locations per country	-
		Activity 4: Field surveys	4.1: Number of field visits	Interview Schedules for women entrepreneurs;	Field reports	Project File	As per the sampling (will update later)	-	As per the sampling (will update later)	-

Expected Output	Objectives (to achieve Output)	Activity	Indicator	Instrument	Means of Verification	Where to publish	Target Number (to be achieved)	Baseline (Quarter 1)	Milestone 1 (Quarter 4)	Milestone 2 (Quarter 8)
			4.2: Number of traders surveyed using questionnaire	government officials and agents engaged in supply chain	Field reports		275	-	275	-
			4.3: Number of focus group discussions					16 (4 in each Country)	-	16 (4 in each Country)
Output 2 - Country-wise recommendations to modify the text of TFA in such a way that it becomes gender responsive	Objective 2 - Conduct gender based analysis of Trade Facilitation Measures (TFMs) given in TFA		4.4: Number of country-specific case studies produced		Case studies		4	-	4	-
			4.5: Number of policy briefs produced		Policy briefs		4	-	4	-
Output 3 - Guide to prepare gender responsive trade policies in BBIN countries to promote women entrepreneurs/traders. This will help in achieving the target set in WTO Ministerial Conference in Buenos Aires in 2017	Objective 3 - Create awareness on gender-inclusive trade facilitation among Bangladesh, Bhutan, India and Nepal	Activity 5: Grassroots-level awareness generation meetings	5.1: Number of meetings	Presentation and Country-specific case studies, Awareness generation monitoring questionnaire	List of participants	Project File and Website	15 (3 each In BBN, and 6 in India)	-	-	15 (3 each In BBN, and 6 in India)
			5.2: Number of participants				375 (25 in each meeting)	-	-	375 (25 in each meeting)
			5.3: Number of meeting reports		15		-	-	15	
			5.4: Number of press release produced		15		-	-	15	

Expected Output	Objectives (to achieve Output)	Activity	Indicator	Instrument	Means of Verification	Where to publish	Target Number (to be achieved)	Baseline (Quarter 1)	Milestone 1 (Quarter 4)	Milestone 2 (Quarter 8)
			5.5: Number of country-specific case studies disseminated		Dissemination list		375	-	-	375
			5.6: Number of policy briefs disseminated		Dissemination list		375	-	-	375
		Activity 6: Exposure visits	No. of participants	6.1: Number of visits	List of participants	Project File and Website	2	-	-	2
				6.2: Number of participants			40 (20 each)	-	-	40
				6.3: Number of reports			2	-	-	2
				6.4: Number of press release produced			2	-	-	2
		Objective 4 - Suggest country-wise recommendations in favour of women responsive TFA in particular and trade policy in general for their better	Activity 7: National policy dialogues	7.1: Number of meetings	Presentation and dissemination of Country-specific case studies and policy briefs	Project File and Website	4	-	-	4
				7.2: Number of participants			160	-	-	160
				7.3: Number of meeting reports			4	-	-	4
				7.4: Number of press release			4	-	-	4

Expected Output	Objectives (to achieve Output)	Activity	Indicator	Instrument	Means of Verification	Where to publish	Target Number (to be achieved)	Baseline (Quarter 1)	Milestone 1 (Quarter 4)	Milestone 2 (Quarter 8)		
	participation in trade and trade related activities		produced									
			7.5: Number of country-specific case studies disseminated		Dissemination list		160	-	-	160		
			7.6: Number of policy briefs disseminated		Dissemination list		160	-	-	160		
		Activity 8: Regional policy dialogue	8.1: Number of meetings	Presentation and dissemination of research report and other outputs of the study	List of participants	Project File and Website	1	-	-	1		
			8.2: Number of participants		80		-	-	80			
			8.3: Number of meeting reports		Meeting Report		1	-	-	1		
			8.4: Number of press release produced		Press Releases		1	-	-	1		
			8.5: Number of country-specific survey reports disseminated		Dissemination list		320	-	-	320		
			8.6: Number of policy briefs		Dissemination list		320	-	-	320		

Expected Output	Objectives (to achieve Output)	Activity	Indicator	Instrument	Means of Verification	Where to publish	Target Number (to be achieved)	Baseline (Quarter 1)	Milestone 1 (Quarter 4)	Milestone 2 (Quarter 8)
			disseminated							
			8.7: Number of research reports disseminated		Dissemination list		80	-	-	80
Activity 9: Research Report			9.1: Number of reports produced	Research report	Research Report	Project File and Website	1	-	-	1
			9.2: Number of research reports disseminated		Dissemination list		1500	-	-	1500

